

January 2015

Unit 2: Hetch-Hetchy Talk-it-Out

Wendy Rouse
San Jose State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.sjsu.edu/soc_sci_pub



Part of the [Curriculum and Instruction Commons](#), [Curriculum and Social Inquiry Commons](#), and the [Educational Methods Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Rouse, Wendy L. "Unit 2: Hetch-Hetchy Talk-it-Out." *Social Studies Review*, 2015-16, vol. 54. p. 101-107.
Part of the larger article: "Units That Illustrate Measurable Performance Activity Models," p. 92-107.
Available at: http://works.bepress.com/wendy_rouse/29/

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Sociology and Interdisciplinary Social Sciences at SJSU ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Publications, Social Sciences by an authorized administrator of SJSU ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact scholarworks@sjsu.edu.

might be chronological but does not have to be. Students now have the order of ideas in what will be the body of the essay.

The final summation paragraph (using the term *conclusion* for this often confuses students into thinking this is where for the first time they spring their thesis on the reader) will contain the thesis, main ideas explained in the body, and a statement or two about the significance of this issue.

Before students begin to actually write, they need to review the rubric on which their work will be scored. They also need to see sample essays, and in this case one arguing each position. To clarify the task even more, students can score the samples, in a class discussion, using the rubric. The sample essays used for this DBQ are not reproduced here, but one of each (Yes and No) were given to students, who then scored the essays and talked through the criteria and the qualitative indicators of the rubric.

Students are now ready to write their essays. For LCAP reporting purposes they would be scored on the Persuasive Essay Rubric, with the DBQ criteria of using and sourcing and validating documents added to it.

Unit 2: Hetch Hetchy Talk-it-Out

This activity from Dr. Wendy Rouse guides students through conversation about documents as they come to a final position. This activity itself could be scored on the presentation rubric, or with slight modification the conference rubric, both of which are in the article on general rubrics. The persuasive essay could also be a separate summative activity, and the persuasive essay rubric would be used.

The Hetch Hetchy Valley, near Yosemite Valley and to the casual observer looking much the same, was made into a reservoir for San Francisco and much of the Bay Area almost a century ago. This activity has students examine the controversy over building the dam that made Hetch Hetchy into a lake, decide who had the best argument, and how that impacted California then and now. Documents referenced are included to reference student statements.

History-Social Science Content Standards:

8.12.5 - Examine the location and effects of urbanization, renewed immigration, and industrialization (e.g., the effects on social fabric of cities, wealth and economic opportunity, the conservation movement).

11.2.9 - Understand the effect of political programs and activities of the Progressives (e.g., federal regulation of railroad transport, Children's Bureau, the Sixteenth Amendment, Theodore Roosevelt, Hiram Johnson).

11.11.5 - Trace the impact of, need for, and controversies associated with environmental conservation, expansion of the national park system, and the development of environmental protection laws, with particular attention to the interaction between environmental protection advocates and property rights advocates.

Guiding Questions:

How did the rapid settlement of cities, increased immigration and industrialization contribute to debates over conservation and preservation? How did the Hetch Hetchy issue come to symbolize this debate? In what ways did this issue reveal divisions among Progressive reformers?

Historical and Social Science Analysis Skills:

Grades 6-8: Chronological and Spatial Thinking

1. Students explain how major events are related to one another in time.

Grades 6-8: Research, Evidence and Point of View

5. Students detect the different historical points of view on historical events and determine the context in which the historical statements were made (the questions asked, sources used, author's perspectives).

Grades 6-8: Historical Interpretation

1. Students explain the central issues and problems from the past, placing people and events in a matrix of time and place.

Grades 9-12: Chronological and Spatial Thinking

1. Students compare the present with the past, evaluating the consequences of past events and decisions and determining the lessons that were learned.

Grades 9-12: Research, Evidence and Point of View

2. Students identify bias and prejudice in historical interpretations.

Grades 9-12: Historical Interpretation

2. Students recognize the complexity of historical causes and effects, including the limitations on determining cause and effect.

Grades 9-12: Historical Interpretation

3. Students interpret past events and issues within the context in which an event unfolded rather than solely in terms of present-day norms and values.

Common Core Skills:

Grade 8: Speaking and Listening Standard 1. Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grade 8 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly. a. Come to discussions prepared, having read or researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence on the topic, text, or issue to probe and reflect on ideas under discussion. b. Follow rules for collegial discussions and decision-making, track progress toward specific goals and deadlines, and define individual roles as needed. c. Pose questions that connect the ideas of several speakers and respond to others' questions and comments with relevant evidence, observations, and ideas. d. Acknowledge new information expressed by others, and, when warranted, qualify or justify their own views in light of the evidence presented.

Grade 8: Speaking and Listening Standard 3. Delineate a speaker's argument and specific claims, evaluating the soundness of the reasoning and relevance and sufficiency of the evidence and identifying when irrelevant evidence is introduced.

Grade 11: Speaking and Listening Standard 1. Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 11–12 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas. b. Work with peers to promote civil, democratic discussions and decision-making, set clear goals and deadlines, and establish individual roles as needed. c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that probe reasoning and evidence; ensure a hearing for a full range of positions on a topic or issue; clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions; and promote divergent and creative perspectives. d. Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives; synthesize comments, claims, and evidence made on all sides of an issue; resolve contradictions when possible; and determine what additional information or research is required to deepen the investigation or complete the task.

Grade 11: Speaking and Listening Standard 3. Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric, assessing the stance, premises, links among ideas, word choice, points of emphasis, and tone used.

Primary or Secondary Source:

Statements of John Muir, James Phelan and Gifford Pinchot, California Water System map,

Instructional Strategy:

Talk-it-Out

Organization:

Students work in pairs to complete a think aloud and, optionally, a paraphrasing activity for the two documents. Next, students rotate in rows to work in pairs with different partners for the talk-it-out. Finally, students work as individuals to complete the exit ticket.

Time Duration: 50 – 60 minutes

Required Materials:

Muir handout (1 per student), Phelan handout (1 per student), Pinchot handout (1 per student), California Water System map

Step-By-Step Procedures:**Anticipatory Set:**

1. Ask students to take one minute to respond to the following prompts:

- *What issues does California currently face with its water supply?*
- *What issues do you think California has faced in the past with its water supply?*

2. After a minute has passed, ask individual students to share their responses in a pair and share. Lead a brief class discussion to elicit student responses. Tie past to present by clarifying that there are differences and similarities between the water scarcity issue in the past and today.

Building on Prior Knowledge and Providing Context:

3. Post the following populations statistics on the board. Ask students to take a few minutes to examine the statistics:

1880-422,128; 1890-547,618; 1900-658,111; 1910-925,708

Statistics based off of United States Census Bureau population data for nine Bay Area counties.

- *How many new people arrived to the San Francisco Bay Area between 1880 and 1910?*
- *What impact did the increased population place on resources in San Francisco?*
- *What reforms were Progressives proposing to deal with existing issues created by immigration, urbanization and industrialization?*

4. Ask for volunteers to share their responses with the class. You may at this point also ask students to examine a California political map that demonstrates the rapid growth of areas such as Los Angeles and San Francisco. An excellent resource for demonstrating population density and growth after 1860 is available from California, A Changing State: An Atlas for California Students, California Geographic Alliance atlas at http://mappingideas.sdsu.edu/CaliforniaAtlas/atlas/pages/45_county_pop_1860.pdf You may also wish to refer back to previous lessons to discuss why these areas of California were more populated than other areas. Then discuss the following questions:

- *What pressures would this population boom place on the demand for water?*
- *Where would the water come from?*

At this point you will want to help prompt students to use evidence from the physical map to illustrate how geography and precipitation plays a role in the distribution of water in California. Physical geography and precipitation maps are also available from the California Geographic Alliance at http://mappingideas.sdsu.edu/CaliforniaAtlas/atlas/pages/12_physical_geography.pdf and http://mappingideas.sdsu.edu/CaliforniaAtlas/atlas/pages/19_annual_precipitation.pdf

5. Use the maps to help students identify the locations of major rivers flowing from the Sierra Nevada Mountains into the Central Valley. Explain how the winter snow pack and rainfall provides water for the year. Introduce the issues that large cities such as Los Angeles and San Francisco had in locating a proper water supply. Describe the system of canals and reservoirs that were built to help supply water to outlying towns and cities, using Los Angeles and the Owens River as an example. Explain that in the early 1900s some San Franciscans proposed that a new reservoir and dam be built in the Hetch Hetchy Valley to provide water for San Francisco's growing population. The Tuolumne River flows into the valley with run-off water from the Sierra Nevada Mountains. The construction of the dam would provide drinking water and electricity for the people of the city of San Francisco. Politicians and government officials saw the construction of the dam as the solution to the peoples problems. Conservationists urged caution but recognized that the limited and proper use of natural resources is necessary. Preservationists however, disagreed and argued instead that the valley should be protected and preserved against the devastation that building a dam might cause to the ecosystem.

6. Ask students to move into side-by-side pairs. Explain that they will be reading through two documents. The first is a statement from John Muir, a noted environmentalist. The second is a statement by James Phelan, Mayor of San Francisco. Explain that both men had very strong opinions about whether or not to dam the Hetch Hetchy Valley. Through a think-aloud, students will identify each of the arguments that each man makes to support his point of view.

7. Introduce and model the process of a think aloud. Explain that students will work in pairs to take turns reading the documents out loud. The first student will read John Muir's statement out loud while the second student will silently read along. In a think aloud, the student who is reading the document out loud pauses at certain points to note key arguments, paraphrase main ideas, and pose questions. Ask students to underline the major arguments that each author makes. Students should circle any words that they do not understand. Model an example think aloud:

"The author's point here seems to be . . ." "I wonder what the author means by . . ." "I think the author's argument here is . . ."

8. After the first student has read John Muir's statement and completed the think-aloud, the second student will re-read John Muir. This time, however, the student thinking-aloud will pause at appropriate points and debate the author making counter-arguments. The teacher should model this process
"I would have to disagree with Muir's point here because . . ." "Muir's argument may be weak here in that . . ."

9. Repeat the same process with the second student reading James Phelan's document aloud and summarizing key arguments. The first student then re-reads Phelan's document aloud and offers counterpoints.

10. Next, ask the pairs to work together to summarize Phelan and Muir's key arguments in at the bottom of the page use direct evidence from the text.

Engaging Students/Active Learning Strategy:

11. Ask students to move into side-by-side pairs by turning two rows of desks facing in toward each other. Student desks should form neat rows that run perpendicular to the front of the room and the screen. Ask students to be sure that there is enough distance between groups so that they can hear their partner speaking.

12. Explain that you will now work together to understand the arguments more in depth through a talk-it-out in which they will be talking out the documents with various individuals in the class. Explain that in order to do this activity, you will be asking them to rotate their seats from time-to-time. Demonstrate how each row will rotate in a snake-like fashion. Be sure that all backpacks and other materials are removed from underneath the desks and the surrounding floor at this time. Ask students to remove all material including course readings, pens,

and textbooks from their desks. Ask students to practice rotating a few times in order to ensure proper flow.

13. Explain and model the process of a talk-it-out. The talk-it-out begins when you project a sentence starter on the screen. The first student then will have approximately one minute to complete the sentence starter and expand on the idea. Clarify that the second student should not speak while the first student is speaking but should practice active-listening skills. Demonstrate some non-verbal ways that a person shows that they are listening. Explain that after a minute has passed you will ring a bell and wait for their silence. Once all students are listening again you will project a prompt for the second student to discuss. This will happen a few times before you ask students to rotate. Begin talk-it-out after clarifying which student is Student A and which student is Student B.

Talk-it-out Prompts:

Student A: Muir's main argument is... and he proves this by asserting...

Student B: You have nicely summed up Muir's main argument as... Muir made an especially convincing point when he wrote...

Student B: However, the major weakness in Muir's argument appears to be...

Student A: You have suggested that Muir's argument was weak in that... To elaborate on your idea, Muir's argument was also flawed when he wrote...

ROTATE

Student B: Phelan's central assertion is... and he supports this by...

Student A: You have clearly summed up Phelan's main argument as... Phelan made an excellent point when he...

Student A: Yet, a flaw in Phelan's argument is...

Student B: You have identified a clear flaw in Phelan's argument in that... Phelan's argument is also a bit weak when he said...

ROTATE

Student A: Muir's point of view differs substantially from Phelan's because...

Student B: Phelan and Muir's perspectives most also possibly differ because...

Student B: Muir's experiences likely shaped his perspective in that... S

tudent A: Likewise, Phelan's opinion was also influenced by his experiences...

At this point you may choose to ask students to pause to read a third source, a statement by Gifford Pinchot, reflecting the views of conservationists. Students may then be asked to consider how this view reflects larger divisions within the conservation movement and the Progressive movement as a whole. Additional prompts for a talk- it-out may include:

Student B: The debate over Hetch Hetchy suggests larger historical changes in early 20th century California such as...

Student A: You have mentioned changes such as... I would also add that additional historical events were also impacting California for example...

Student A: The Hetch Hetchy issue is linked to the Progressive Era in that...

Student B: In addition to the connections with the Progressive Era such as... the whole Hetch Hetchy debate also reveals a split among conservationists and Progressives in that...

If you wish you discuss how the issue relates to present-day discussions over water you may prime students for a follow-up whole-class discussion by posing these prompts:

Student A: The debate over Hetch Hetchy is still significant to us today in that...

Debrief:

Student B: It sounds like you are arguing that... I would also add that environmental conservation and preservation remains an important topic today because...

Student B: However, the present environmental situation is very different than the situation faced by Muir and Phelan in that...

Student A: What I hear you saying is that... I would add that the situation is also different today in that...

14. After students have returned to their original seating arrangements, debrief some of the key ideas students discussed especially with regard to the development of a conservation movement and the Progressive movement. Wrap up the activity by explaining to students that the debate over whether to build the dam or not continued until the dam was finally completed in 1923. A 167-mile long aqueduct was built to carry water from the reservoir to San Francisco. Water from the reservoir supplies 2.4 million Californians in the San Francisco Bay Area. It also provided electricity for San Francisco. Even today, preservationists from the Sierra Club argue that the dam should be destroyed and Hetch Hetchy Valley restored to its original location. Discuss pertinent key issues in the water shortage and preservationist debates today. Be wary of presentism and be sure to point out both similarities and differences in issues related to conservation today.

15. You may follow-up this activity with an exit ticket writing exercise or extended essay. (See below for prompt)

James D. Phelan Mayor, San Francisco

I will only emphasize the fact that the needs of San Francisco are pressing and urgent. San Francisco is expanding with tremendous rapidity... and already, notwithstanding the threat of a water famine, the outlying district... is being cut up into suburban tracts...

As Californians, we rather resent gentlemen from different parts of the country outside of California telling us that we are invading the beautiful natural resources of the State or in any way marring or detracting from them. We have a greater pride than they in the beauties of California, in the valleys, in the big trees, in the rivers, and in the high mountains... even for a water supply we would not injure the great resources which have made our State the playground of the world. By constructing a dam at this very narrow gorge in the Hetch Hetchy Valley, about 700 feet across, we create, not a reservoir, but a lake... coming upon it, it will look like an emerald gem in the mountains; and one of the few things in which California is deficient, especially in the Sierras, is lakes, and in this way we will contribute, in a large measure, to the scenic grandeur and beauty of California...

...To provide for the little children, men, and women of the 800,000 population who swarm the shores of San Francisco Bay is a matter of much greater importance than encouraging the few who, in solitary loneliness, will sit on the peak of the Sierras loafing around the throne of the God of nature and singing His praise. A benign father loves his children above all things. There is no comparison between the highest use of the water-- the domestic supply--and the mere scenic value of the mountains. When you decide that affirmatively, as you must, and then, on top of that, that we are not detracting from the scenic value of the mountains, but enhancing it...

Source: *House Committee on the Public Lands, Hetch Hetchy Dam Site*, 63rd Cong., 1st sess. (25–28 June 1913; 7 July 1913), (Washington D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1913), 25–29, 165–66, 213–14, 235–38. Reprinted in Roderick Nash, *The Call of the Wild*, 1900–1916 (New York: George Braziller, 1970), 86–95. Available online at <http://historymatters.gmu.edu/d/5721>

<http://gocalifornia.about.com/od/toppicturegallery/ig/Hetch-Hetchy-Pictures/Hetch-Hetchy-Valley-Before-Dam.htm> Wikimedia Commons. http://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/en/f/fd/Hetch_Hetchy_Valley.jpg

John Muir President of the Sierra Club

Hetch Hetchy Valley... is a grand landscape garden, one of Nature's rarest and most precious mountain temples... Sad to say, this most precious and sublime feature of the Yosemite National Park, one of the greatest of all our natural resources for the uplifting joy and peace and health of the people, is in danger of being dammed and made into a reservoir to help supply San Francisco with water and light, thus flooding it from wall to wall and burying its gardens and groves one or two hundred feet deep...

Everybody needs beauty as well as bread, places to play in and pray in, where Nature may heal and cheer and give strength to body and soul alike...

That anyone would try to destroy [Hetch Hetchy Valley] seems; incredible; but sad experience shows that there are people good enough and bad enough for anything. The proponents [supporters] of the dam scheme bring forward a lot of bad arguments to prove that the only righteous thing to do with the people's parks is to destroy them bit by bit as they are able. [They] seem to have a perfect contempt for Nature, and, instead of lifting their eyes to the God of the mountains, lift them to the Almighty Dollar.

Source: John Muir, *The Yosemite* (New York: Century, 1912), 255–257, 260–262. Reprinted in Roderick Nash, *The American Environment: Readings in The History of Conservation* (Reading, Mass.: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, 1968). Available online at <http://historymatters.gmu.edu/d/5720>

16. You may choose to follow-up this activity with an exit ticket writing exercise or an extended essay to assess student learning. Students may be asked to construct a written response to these prompts:

How did immigration, urbanization and industrialization contribute to debates over conservation and preservation in the early twentieth century? How did the Hetch Hetchy issue come to symbolize these debates?

In what ways did this issue reveal divisions among Progressive reformers?

Use a rubric similar to the example provided to assess students' knowledge of the content standard, use of textual evidence to support analysis, and ability to contextualize and corroborate the evidence.

For a LCAP reportable score on a summative rubric, use the Persuasive/Argumentative Rubric in the General Rubric article.

Copyright of Social Studies Review is the property of California Council for the Social Studies and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.