1997

Exemplary virtue : an examination of Annunciation imagery in Renaissance Florence

Sharon Clarice Smith
San Jose State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.sjsu.edu/etd_theses

Recommended Citation

Smith, Sharon Clarice, "Exemplary virtue : an examination of Annunciation imagery in Renaissance Florence" (1997). *Master's Theses*. 1529.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.31979/etd.5zrr-4cg9>

https://scholarworks.sjsu.edu/etd_theses/1529

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Master's Theses and Graduate Research at SJSU ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of SJSU ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact scholarworks@sjsu.edu.

INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI

A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700 800/521-0600

EXEMPLARY VIRTUE: AN EXAMINATION OF
ANNUNCIATION IMAGERY IN RENAISSANCE FLORENCE

A Thesis

Presented to

The Faculty of the School of Art & Design

San Jose State University

In Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree

Master of Arts

by

Sharon Clarice Smith

August 1997

UMI Number: 1386230

**Copyright 1997 by
Smith, Sharon Clarice**

All rights reserved.

**UMI Microform 1386230
Copyright 1997, by UMI Company. All rights reserved.**

**This microform edition is protected against unauthorized
copying under Title 17, United States Code.**

UMI
**300 North Zeeb Road
Ann Arbor, MI 48103**

© 1997

Sharon Clarice Smith

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

APPROVED FOR THE SCHOOL OF ART & DESIGN

Anne Simonson, Ph.D.

David McNeil, Ph.D.

Johanna D. Movassat, Ph.D.

APPROVED FOR THE UNIVERSITY

ABSTRACT

EXEMPLARY VIRTUE: AN EXAMINATION OF ANNUNCIATION IMAGERY IN RENAISSANCE FLORENCE

by Sharon Clarice Smith

This thesis examines the correlation between the increased popularity of images of the Annunciation and the role of patrician-class women during the Florentine Renaissance. Understanding that a theme repeatedly commissioned by a specific group may address concerns within the group, the Annunciation imagery is examined for special messages and/or meanings it held for the women of Florence. Using contemporary literary and religious sources, the conditions for Renaissance women are evaluated. This evaluation reveals an intense concern for the virtue of the women within their society. Two virtues, in particular, are stressed for patrician class women: chastity and motherhood. These virtues were exemplified by the image of the Virgin of the Annunciation.

Table of Contents

	Page
List of Illustrations	vi
Introduction	1
1. Historical Aspects of the Annunciation	4
2. Women in Florentine Society	12
3. Power and Emotion in Imagery: A Renaissance Perspective	23
4. The Public Statement of a Private Commission	29
5. Conclusion	36
Bibliography	39
Plates	49

List of Illustrations

	Page
1. Santissima Annunziata. Façade. Florence.	49
2. Santa Trinitá. Façade. Florence.	50
3. Lorenzo Monaco. <i>Annunciation Altarpiece</i> . Florence.	51
4. Anonymous. Wall Painting. Catacombs of Priscilla. Rome.	52
5. Italian Master. <i>Annunciation</i> . Church of San Marco. Florence. . .	53
6. Lorenzo Monaco. <i>Annunciation Altarpiece</i> . Detail. Florence. . .	54
7. Andrea del Sarto. <i>Annunciation</i> . Florence.	55
8. Giotto. <i>Annunciation</i> . Arena Chapel. Padua.	56
9. Giotto. Interior Arena Chapel. Padua.	57
10. Anonymous. <i>Annunciation</i> . Palatine Chapel. Palermo.	58
11. Titian. <i>The Miracle of the Jealous Husband</i> . Padua.	59
12. Coppo di Marcovaldo. <i>Madonna and Child</i> . Orvieto.	60
13. Filippo Lippi. <i>Madonna and Child with Angels</i> . Florence.	61
14. Andrea del Sarto. <i>Assumption of the Virgin</i> . Florence.	62
15. Michelangelo (attributed to). <i>Madonna and Child with Infant Baptist and Angels</i> (unfinished). London.	63
16. Domenico Ghirlandaio. <i>Birth of Saint John the Baptist</i> . Detail. Florence.	64
17. Andrea del Sarto. <i>Birth of the Virgin</i> . Florence.	65
18. Filippo Lippi. <i>The Annunciation</i> . Florence.	66

19.	Simone Martini. <i>Annunciation</i> . Florence.	67
20.	Pontormo. <i>Annunciation</i> . Florence.	68
21.	Domenico Ghirlandaio. <i>Birth of the Virgin</i> . Florence.	69

Introduction

A legend in Florence tells of a miracle that occurred in the church of the Santissima Annunziata in 1252 (Fig. 1). Commissioned to paint *The Annunciation* on the interior of the facade wall of the church, a young painter found himself unable to complete the work—he could not create anything as beautiful as what he thought the face of the Virgin must be. With all but her face complete, the artist prayed for guidance and fell into a deep sleep on the scaffold. When he awoke the most beautiful image he had ever seen was before him; it is said that the face of the Virgin had been completed by the Holy Spirit.¹ The Servite church dedicated to the Virgin Annunciate became a pilgrimage site and the painting a revered cult image of such status that, from the mid-fifteenth century on, visiting dignitaries entering the city were taken immediately to worship at the site before carrying out their business in Florence.²

As the legend of the miraculous painting in the Santissima Annunziata spread, depictions of the Annunciation increased in Florence. Numerous Florentine churches had paintings of the Annunciation done on the interior wall of their facades. San Marco, Santa Maria Novella, and Santa Felicita were but a few of the churches hoping to recreate the miracle of the Santissima Annunziata within their walls and to become lucrative pilgrimage sites.³ The miracle was not repeated; however, the popularity of the Annunciation imagery continued to increase into the Renaissance period.

The desire to replicate the events at the Santissima Annunziata that created an upsurge in commissions of The Annunciation by Florentine churches, but private commissions of the theme also increased. During the Renaissance the Annunciation became one of the most popular subjects for altarpieces and chapel decoration in Florence.⁴

What could contribute to the increase in commissions of the Annunciation among the private patrons of Renaissance Florence? One may assume that an image so often depicted would have a “general attractiveness” for the original patrons, but beyond the visual appeal, a repeatedly commissioned image may address concerns or desires within that society.⁵ For Renaissance Florence, the concerns or desires addressed by the theme of the Annunciation may have been the virtue of Florentine women: in particular, the virtues of chastity and motherhood. These virtues in the women of the community, be they wife, mother, or daughter, were considered of tremendous importance for the honor and, ultimately, for the success of the paterfamilias and the Florentine family.

Notes

1. The story of the miraculous painting in the Santissima Annunziata is a well known, oft-repeated tale in Florentine history. Details can be found in a variety of texts and articles; for example, the image is referred to by Martin Wackernagel in *The World of the Florentine Renaissance Artist: Projects and Patrons, Workshop and Art Market*, 1938, translated by Alison Luchs (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1981) and in Howard Saalman's article, "Form and Meaning at the Barbadori-Capponi Chapel in S. Felicita," *Burlington Magazine* 131 (August 1989): 532-539. An important part of Florentine folklore, the legend is even found recounted in popular guide books, such as *The Blue Guide*.
2. Richard C. Trexler, *Public Life in Renaissance Florence* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1980), 9.
3. Howard Saalman, "Form and Meaning at the Barbadori-Capponi Chapel in S. Felicita," *Burlington Magazine* 131 (August 1989): 536.
4. The Annunciation and The Adoration of the Magi were the two most popular altarpiece subjects during the Florentine Renaissance. See Charles Hope, "Altarpieces and the Requirements of Patrons," in *Christianity and the Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento*, edited by Timothy Verdon and John Henderson (Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1990), 538.
5. Margaret R. Miles, "The Virgin's One Bare Breast: Nudity, Gender, and Religious Meaning in Tuscan Early Renaissance Culture," in *The Expanding Discourse: Feminism and Art History*, edited by Norma Broude and Mary D. Garrard (New York: Harper Collins Publishers, Inc., 1992), 27-28.

Chapter 1

Historical Aspects of The Annunciation

The popularity of the Annunciation theme in Renaissance Florence is immediately evident even to the most casual visitor to Florence today. In virtually every church in Florence the modern day traveler will find representations of the Annunciation in some form: either as the large central panel of an altarpiece, perhaps in the predella paintings, or crowning the altarpiece in the pinnacles, or as part of an overall fresco cycle within a chapel.

Upon entering the church of Santa Trinità (Fig. 2), for example, the visitor approaching the altar down the left aisle first sees the Capella Strozzi and *The Annunciation* by Jacopo da Empoli, dated to 1603. The next chapel contains an *Annunciation* done in 1570 by Michele Tosini. In the third chapel one finds two representations of the Annunciation: an *Annunciation* in the predella of the *Coronation of the Virgin* altarpiece by Bicci di Lorenzo, 1470, and an earlier, anonymous fresco on the right wall in which the Virgin and Gabriel span an open window in the chapel wall which is shared with the fourth chapel which houses *The Annunciation* painted in 1475 by Neri di Bicci. In addition to these depictions, across the nave one would find Lorenzo Monaco's famous *Annunciation Altarpiece*, ca. 1422-23, in the Bartolini Salimbeni Chapel (Fig. 3). Indeed, the theme of the Annunciation proved to be very popular for chapels in Florence. However, the meaning which these images held in Renaissance

Florence was conveyed by a very old, very traditional image; such images have long been popular in Christian Europe.

Historically, depictions of the scene can be found as far back as the early fourth century in Rome where what may be the first depiction of the Annunciation is found in the Catacombs of Priscilla (Fig. 4). The fourth-century wall painting contains the basic iconography for representing the scene. Two figures occupy an undefined space; the seated Virgin listens to the Archangel Gabriel standing before her. Movement within the scene is limited to Gabriel's arm which is raised in a gesture of speech as he announces, "Hail, thou that art highly favoured, the Lord is with thee: blessed art thou among women."¹

Later representations of the image demonstrate a complex iconography that developed over the centuries. An examination of an anonymous *Annunciation* in the church of San Marco, a depiction said to be based on the now lost miraculous image in the Santissima Annunziata,² provides an illustration of later iconographical developments (Fig. 5). No longer is the scene taking place in an empty space, but the San Marco fresco is depicted in an architectural setting that is rich with detail and symbolism. The Virgin and Gabriel are surrounded by numerous iconographic devices that had become the characteristics of the Annunciation. In the upper zone of the fresco, the dove of the Holy Spirit is released by the hand of God. Gabriel is not raising his arm in the gesture of speech as seen in the earlier *Annunciation*, his divine message is part of the painting, as is Mary's ultimate response, "Behold the handmaid of the

Lord: be it unto me according to thy word.”³ As Gabriel speaks to Mary, she looks up from her book in which she was reading the Old Testament prophecy of Isaiah, important because it foretold of the Annunciation.⁴

Although prophesied in the Book of Isaiah, the story of the Annunciation is derived primarily from the biblical account found in the New Testament Gospel of Luke and through popular, contemporary literary sources for Marian devotion such as *The Golden Legend* and *The Meditations on the Life of Christ*.⁵ In the story of the divine event, Luke explains how Mary was chosen by God to become the mother of Jesus Christ. God dispatched the Archangel Gabriel who appeared to the Virgin and informed her of her role in the birth of the savior. Upon hearing the news, Mary expressed her concern over the vow of chastity she had taken, “How shall this be, seeing I know not a man?”⁶ Gabriel assured the Virgin that her chastity would remain intact, “The Holy Ghost shall come upon thee, and the Power of the Highest shall overshadow thee: therefore also that holy thing which shall be born of thee shall be called the Son of God.”⁷ Confident in the angel’s explanation, the Virgin accepted her destiny as the mother of the Son of God.

The culminating moment of the Annunciation is the moment of conception: The Incarnation of Jesus Christ. The Incarnation occurs when the Holy Spirit descends upon the Virgin, often represented in painting as a dove sent to earth on golden rays of light (Fig. 6), and Mary miraculously conceives the Christ while her virginity remains forever intact. Her perpetual purity is symbolically

represented by the lily; three lilies on a stalk represent her virginity *ante partem*, *in partu*, and *post partem* (Fig. 7).

This moment of miraculous transfiguration is strongly associated with the mystery of Transubstantiation. Just as the Holy Spirit descended upon Mary, the Holy Spirit descends over the altar and mystically transforms the Host into the body of Christ during the rites of the Catholic mass. Both of these events, the Incarnation and the Transubstantiation, are considered central mysteries of the Catholic dogma.⁸

The important parallels between these events make the theme of the Annunciation a particularly appropriate subject for altarpieces and chapels. Often in early representations of the Annunciation, the placement within a chapel held a symbolic reference to these mysteries. Giotto's monumental work in the Arena Chapel in Padua (Fig. 8 and 9) echoed earlier medieval and Byzantine traditions (Fig. 10) in indicating the occurrence of the Incarnation by placing the figures of Gabriel and Mary in the spandrels flanking the chancel arch, thus providing a separation of the figures across an architectural opening that expresses "the miraculous transmission of divine impregnation."⁹ In the same images, a reference to the Transubstantiation may be found in the pulled-back curtain behind each figure. Seen here, the open curtains expose the mystical conversation of Mary and Gabriel. The Host, within its tabernacle on the altar, was often concealed by curtains that when parted would reveal the miraculous object to the congregation.¹⁰

Just as the motif of separating the figures was a reference to older artistic traditions, so the pulled-back and knotted curtain motif used by Giotto has precedence in classical and medieval art where it was used symbolically to indicate scenes of “inspired revelation.”¹¹ The curtains may also represent “the veils of the tabernacle of the ark,” to which Mary is often compared.¹²

In addition to the liturgical qualities represented by the curtains, the flowing fabric of the curtains may be a reference to finely woven fabric hung as decoration during celebrations of the feastday of the Annunciation, 25 March:¹³ a day of much celebration indeed.

In Florence, as in other European cities, 25 March marked the first day of the new year; it remained the first day of the Florentine calendar until 1750 with the adoption of the papal calendar. Festivals, pilgrimages, and religious dramas marked this day of new beginnings, and these events were an intricate part of Florentine society. With the exception of a brief period between 1412 and 1416-17, during which time the major observance of the day was transferred to the Cathedral of Florence, the Feast of the Annunciation was primarily celebrated at the church of the Santissima Annunziata.¹⁴ Here the Arte di Calimala performed an annual pilgrimage to the site of the miraculous painting of *The Annunciation* on the morning of the feastday, paying appropriate homage with a required donation of candles, lamp oil, and consecrated wine as established by the bequest of Piero de’Medici who had commissioned the chapel which housed the celebrated cult image to the guild.¹⁵

Religious dramas of the Annunciation were staged at various churches throughout Florence. These elaborate spectacles included highly-developed set constructions and intricate lighting effects achieved through various means, and possibly even the use of fireworks.¹⁶ The prominent architect, Filippo Brunelleschi, designed sets for plays at both the Santissima Annunziata and Santa Felice in Piazza.¹⁷ The intensely dramatic display at Santa Felice included a “marvellous apparatus consisting of a heavenly globe surrounded by two circles of angels, out of which Gabriel flew down in a machine shaped like an almond.”¹⁸ Giorgio Vasari provided a detailed account of the staging of this play and credited the invention of this complex machinery to Brunelleschi himself.¹⁹

Tremendous thought and planning went into these extravagant pageants that celebrated this monumental moment in Christian history, the moment when the important virtues of the Virgin are most completely expressed. She is chaste, she has conceived a son, and she will fulfill her ultimate role as a mother. The Virgin was portrayed in The Annunciation as the ideal woman of Renaissance Florence.

Notes

-
1. *The Holy Bible*. King James Version. Philadelphia: The National Bible Press, n.d. Luke 1:28.
 2. Howard Saalman, "Form and Meaning at the Barbadori-Capponi Chapel in S. Felicita." *Burlington Magazine* 131 (August 1989): 536.
 3. Luke 1:38.
 4. Isaiah 7:14, "Therefore the Lord himself shall give you a sign; Behold, a virgin shall conceive, and bear a son, and shall call his name Immanuel."
 5. The primary source for the Annunciation in *The Holy Bible* is Luke 1:26-38; however, references to the virgin birth of the son of God can be found elsewhere in the bible, for example in the book of Isaiah as noted above. Other sources include *The Golden Legend*, a collection of saints' lives dating to ca. 1261, and *The Meditations on the Life of Christ*, an apocryphal text thought to have been written in the fourteenth century. See: Voragine, Jacobus de, *The Golden Legend*, translated by Granger Ryan and Helmut Ripperger (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1941); and Ragusa, Isa, and Rosalie B. Green, editors, *Meditations on the Life of Christ: An Illustrated Manuscript of the Fourteenth Century*, translated by Isa Ragusa (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1961).
 6. Luke 1:34.
 7. Luke 1:35.
 8. Barbara G. Lane, *The Altar and The Altarpiece: Sacramental Themes in Early Netherlandish Painting* (New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1984), 41.
 9. Marilyn Aronberg Lavin, *The Place of the Narrative: Mural Decoration in Italian Churches, 421-1600* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1990), 48.
 10. Lane, *The Altar and The Altarpiece*, 41-42.
 11. Lavin, *The Place of the Narrative*, 48.
 12. Ibid.

13. Ibid.

14. See Mary Bergstein, "Marian Politics in Quattrocento Florence: The Renewed Dedication of Santa Maria del Fiore in 1412." *Renaissance Quarterly* 44 (Winter 1991): 673-719. In March 1412, after the dedication of the Cathedral of Florence from Santa Reparata to Santa Maria del Fiore, the Florentine councils of the Popolo and the Commune had declared the feastday of the Cathedral as 25 March. The city fathers stipulated that all Florentines, with the exception of the Servites who celebrated at their church of the Santissima Annunziata, must celebrate the Feast of the Annunciation at Santa Maria del Fiore. In February 1416-17, the Servites petitioned to keep the Feast of the Annunciation as their feastday alone and were granted that right. Upon this decision, the feastday of the Cathedral was transferred to the day of the Purification of the Virgin, 2 February.

15. Martin Wackernagel, *The World of the Florentine Renaissance Artist: Projects and Patrons, Workshop and Art Market*, 1938, translated by Alison Luchs (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1981), 213.

16. Nerida Newbigin, "The Word Made Flesh: The *Rappresentazioni* of Mysteries and Miracles in Fifteenth-Century Florence," in *Christianity and the Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento*, edited by Timothy Verdon and John Henderson (Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1990), 366.

17. Jacob Burckhardt, *The Civilization of the Renaissance in Italy*, translated by S.G.C. Middlemore (London: Penguin Books, 1990), 260; Giorgio Vasari, *Lives of the Artists*, volume 1, translated by George Bull (London: Penguin Books, 1987), 166-168; Mark S. Weil, "The Relationship of the Comaro Chapel to Mystery Plays and Italian Court Theatre," in *"All the World's a Stage..." Art and Pageantry in the Renaissance and Baroque*, part 2, edited by Barbara Wisch and Susan Scott Munshower, *Theatrical Spectacle and Spectacular Theatre*, Papers in Art History for The Pennsylvania State University, volume 6 (University Park, Penn.: Pennsylvania State University, 1990): 460-461.

18. Burckhardt, *The Civilization of the Renaissance in Italy*, 260.

19. Vasari, *Lives of the Artists*, 166-168.

Chapter 2

Women in Florentine Society

...woman is a vain and frivolous thing.... If you have women in your house, keep an eye on them. Survey the premises often, and while going about your business keep them in a state of apprehension and fear.... Women should emulate the Virgin Mary, who did not leave her house to go drinking all over town, ogle handsome men, or listen to a lot of idle talk. No, she stayed home, behind closed doors, in the privacy of her own home, as was only proper.¹

These thoughts, expressed by Paolo de Certaldo in the fourteenth century, illustrate some of the anxieties which were becoming of increasing concern for the patriarchal society of the Florentine patrician class. By the height of the Renaissance, commentaries addressing the behavior of women were commonplace. Contemporary authors and moralists, clergymen and city officials expressed their concerns over and their desire for virtuous women in Florentine society openly and often. And even though these sources may have been “prescriptive rather than descriptive,”² the role of women within this society was obviously a worrisome issue that they felt needed to be addressed. How might the imagery of the Annunciation address these concerns?

The primary role for women was to remain virtuous--her strongest virtues being chastity and motherhood. She was reminded of these virtues every time she gazed upon an Annunciation scene and reflected upon the writings in

devotional texts, such as *The Meditations on the Life of Christ* written in the fourteenth-century by an anonymous author called Psuedo-Bonaventura,

And see how the Lady remains timorous and humble, with modest face, as she is accosted by the angel, not becoming proud and boastful after his unforeseen words, in hearing such wonderful things as had never been told to anyone before, but attributing everything to divine grace. Thus you may learn by her example to be modest and humble, because without these attributes virginity is worth little.³

There can be little doubt what the pious woman was to concentrate on while viewing these images. Understanding the intended messages, the Florentine woman should strive to “emulate the Virgin Mary” as Paolo de Certaldo had recommended.

Contemporary moralists reinforced Renaissance society’s desire for women to perpetuate these characteristics, to be the ideal woman in this male-dominated culture. Leon Battista Alberti, San Bernardino, and others expounded repeatedly in their writing and preaching upon the need for women to remain virtuous, so much so that women may not have been living up to *their* expectations and, therefore needed constant reminders in literature and in art.

Deviations from the desired behavior could result in severe punishment for the woman. Legislation had given husbands and fathers the right to punish members of his family with physical violence if he deemed necessary.⁴ Society had given them the moral right. A man’s implementation of this right, particularly with regard to his wife, is said to have been generally met with approval.⁵ The Sienese friar Cherubino condoned such action explaining that a wife should be

reprimanded gently at first, but with blows if necessary.⁶ San Bernardino also reaffirmed a husband's right to batter when he exclaimed to the women of Siena that if he were their husband he would indeed strike them for their inappropriate dress.⁷

A woman's chastity was of the utmost importance. It was used as a measure of a woman's worth in this society. In his treatise, *On the Family*, Alberti expressed patrician class concerns on the subject,

Chastity in a wife has always been the ornament of the family; a mother's chastity has always been part of a daughter's dowry; chastity has always been worth more to anyone than beauty.... God never punishes women so severely as when they are unchaste...⁸

In a discussion about the status of women in the Italian Renaissance, Rona Goffen used *The Miracle of the Jealous Husband* (Fig. 11), a fresco by Titian, executed in the early sixteenth century, to emphasize patrician Renaissance society's acceptance of violence against women.⁹ The fresco is based on a story from the life of St. Anthony in which a Tuscan knight stands over his terrified wife, her blouse already stained red by the blood of a stab wound to her right breast. With one hand he grabs her hair, the other holds a dagger poised for the fatal plunge. This murder is her punishment for supposed infidelities. As the narrative continues in the background, the knight is seen receiving redemption from St. Anthony.

In his depiction Titian neglected to portray a key part of the story, the resurrection of the wife and, instead, he focused his attention on the act of

violence against the woman and then on the forgiveness of the husband.

Although the outcome in this fresco is extreme, the moral message implied by the work reinforces the notion that for the unchaste wife, violent punishment is acceptable.

To avoid any possible threat to a woman's chastity, authors such as the aforementioned Paolo de Certaldo and Leon Battista Alberti recommended that women stay in their homes, away from public scrutiny.

I kept for myself the tasks of going out among men and earning money outside the home and left to my wife the care of lesser domestic matters. That is what I did, for to tell the truth, it would not be very honorable for my wife to deal with men in public, in the streets...¹⁰

Florentine women were so excluded from public roles that in 1610, Gragier de Liverdes commented, "In Florence women are more enclosed than in any other part of Italy; they see the world only from the small openings in their windows."¹¹

Secure within the walls of their *palazzo*, a husband or father could keep a watchful eye on their wife and daughters thereby ensuring the woman's chastity, "the fortress of their virtue."¹² Remaining virtuous a young girl could marry and fulfill her role in society which was "first and foremost a reproductive responsibility in the home."¹³

Florentine citizens were becoming increasingly concerned with population rates during the late Middle Ages. Prior to the Renaissance period in Florence the state of marriage was considered honorable but inferior to the state of celibacy, an attitude which undoubtedly led to a low birthrate within the

populace.¹⁴ This tendency had prevailed until the late trecento when, with the population declining rapidly due to devastating plagues and food shortages, city leaders and moralists could hardly afford to continue endorsing celibacy.¹⁵ In the late trecento, when the need for procreation was evident for the survival of the city of Florence,

Coluccio Salutati, the dean of civic humanists...stressed that marriage sanctified the natural union of the sexes. Children born in wedlock alone assured the survival of the family and of society. The active citizen had necessarily to be a married man.¹⁶

Salutati expressed both a shift in attitudes toward matrimony and desire for procreation, and it appears that Florentine society responded. Birthrates for the upper levels of Florentine society were extremely high during the Renaissance period. The diary of a Florentine merchant, Gregorio Dati, provides one with the sense of importance childbearing had as he lists his numerous children by his various wives:

On Sunday, 17 May 1394, Betta gave birth to a girl whom we called Bandecca...on Friday, 17 March 1396...the lord blessed our marriage with a male...12 March 1397, Betta gave birth to our third child...27 April 1398...our fourth child...July 1399, our fifth...22 June 1400, Betta gave birth for the sixth time...13 July 1401, the Lord lent us a seventh child...5 July 1402...Betta gave birth to our eighth child...After that my wife Isabetta passed on to paradise...I had eight children with my second wife, Betta...eleven children with my third wife...¹⁷

Altogether Dati lists twenty children by his first three wives. There were more; however, they were not included in his account because he was "not counting those that did not live to be baptized."¹⁸

As one might expect, with this high number of pregnancies, women often died as a result of puerperal complications. In 1427, one out of every sixty-nine women who gave birth in Florence died of ailments related to childbearing.¹⁹ For Dati the ratio was even worse; his first three wives died of complications related to childbirth. Following the death of his third wife, he married a fourth time and had even more children.

In an interesting theory, Richard Goldthwaite stated that the extraordinary number of images related to the portrayal of birth and motherhood indicated a society in which “children became a much more central part of family life.” He continued,

What else can explain the happy, even sensuous fascination with infants in representations of the Christ Child and the playful putti which abound...is it going too far to suggest that the numerous representations of the Holy Family...arose from a conscious effort to apotheosize the child-oriented family?²⁰

Indeed the portrayal of children had changed from the somewhat stiff and somber child seen in such works as *Madonna and Child*, ca. 1265, by Coppo di Marcovaldo (Fig. 12), a Florentine artist working in the Byzantine style, to numerous illustrations of children with the lively and emotional qualities inherent in childhood. In Filippo Lippi's *Madonna with Child and Angels* (Fig. 13), the pudgy Christ child reaches for his mother while an impish youth playfully gazes out at the viewer. Delightful chubby putti lift the Virgin's mantle in Andrea del Sarto's *Assumption of the Virgin* (Fig. 14), and with motion typical of a toddler,

Christ innocently tugs at his mother's book in *Madonna and Child with the Infant Baptist and Angels*, attributed to Michelangelo (Fig. 15).

Despite the new interest in depicting children as they actually were, however, an indifference is said to have existed toward very young children in Florentine culture. Herlihy and Klapisch-Zuber have pointed out that in the early stages of life parents often ignored, even forgot about their progeny; their offspring possessed a "kind of transparency."²¹

Children were often sent away shortly after birth to a wetnurse in the country and were not reunited with their families for several years. Even if the wetnurse was brought into the home, as was seen in the wealthier families (this was more expensive than sending the child to the country), the child spent a great deal of time in the care of non-related caretakers.

The distancing of infants from parents was the result of both physical and emotional needs. The desire for optimum fertility demanded the utilization of wetnurses; nursing one's own infant could provide for periods of infertility. The upper classes felt they must take full advantage of their fertile years by producing offspring virtually every year they could, a pattern seen in Dati's diary.

Emotionally, the high mortality rate of infants before the age of two necessitated a state of detachment until the child passed this dangerous time.²² Could a parent afford the emotional distress that would come of forming strong attachments to a child they would lose at such a tender age? So many infants succumbed that the playful putti referred to by Goldthwaite and seen in

innumerable Renaissance paintings were “identified with the souls of children who had died in infancy.”²³

Much of the denial of the recognition of infant children may be the result of instruction of the pedagogues and the fears of the male populace. The Florentine patriarch was very interested in the continuation of the patrilineage and may only have felt the ability to develop a bond with his children once they had survived the early precarious years. Perhaps Alberti was justifying this behavior under the guise of protecting the fragile child when he wrote,

Every little thing twists and deforms their tender little bones. If one touches or hold them without the greatest care, their limbs are dislocated, and because of this at times they are later crooked and misshapen. A child of tender age should be kept out of his father's arms. Let him rest and sleep in his mother's lap.²⁴

But how does one explain the popular portrayal of birth scenes in the art of Renaissance Florence? If painting can be used as a measure, for the patrician class women of Florence the birth of a child was seen as a time of joy, despite all the reasons to remain ambivalent. Numerous depictions of birth scenes show women visiting the new mother and affectionately tending to the care of the newborn infant. Set in Florentine patrician interiors, many of the images such as Domenico Ghirlandaio's *Birth of John the Baptist* suggest a particularly special time for women (Fig. 16).

In Ghirlandaio's fresco, guests enter a well-appointed room to pay their respects to the mother as a servant rushes in with food and drink (note the wetnurse in the foreground of the painting.) A similar gathering is depicted in

The Birth of the Virgin by Andrea del Sarto (Fig. 17). Women dressed in the latest Florentine fashions visit Saint Anne during her lying-in period: the time after the birth of the child in which a mother was restricted to bed for approximately twenty days.

Beginning on or about the eighth day after childbirth, a new mother would begin receiving visitors. During this time she remained in bed, recuperating from her ordeal. Since so many guests would see the chamber, it was very important that this room be as beautifully decorated as possible.²⁵ This sumptuously appointed room and all the possessions within reflected the good taste and financial status of the man who owned the home; therefore, the lying-in period, a time that seemingly pertained to the mother and child, actually served to enhance the image of the paterfamilias with a display of his ownership and wealth despite his indifference toward his young offspring.

The Renaissance patriarch may or may not have celebrated the birth of his child, but his desire for offspring and a virtuous wife was strongly declared in contemporary literature and art. The Virgin of the Annunciation provided both: she was obviously fertile and she epitomized virtue.

Notes

-
1. Paolo de Certaldo as quoted in Charles de La Ronciere, "Tuscan Notables on the Eve of the Renaissance," in *A History of Private Life*, volume 2, *Revelations of the Medieval World*, edited by Philippe Aries and Georges Duby, translated by Arthur Goldhammer (Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1988), 285.
 2. Joan Kelly, "Did Women Have a Renaissance?" In *Women, History & Theory: The Essays of Joan Kelly* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984), 20.
 3. Isa Ragusa and Rosalie B. Green, editors, *Meditations on the Life of Christ: An Illustrated Manuscript of the Fourteenth Century*, translated by Isa Ragusa (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1961), 14.
 4. La Ronciere, "Tuscan Notables on the Eve of the Renaissance," 208.
 5. Ibid.
 6. Margaret King, *Women of the Renaissance* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991), 43.
 7. Ibid.
 8. Leon Battista Alberti, *The Albertis of Florence: Leon Battista Alberti's Della Famiglia*, translated by Guido A Guarino (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 1971), 221.
 9. Rona Goffen, "Titian, His Donors, and Sacred Subjects," in *Titian: Prince of Painters*, exhibition catalogue, edited by Susanna Biadene (Venice: Marsilio Editori, 1990), 85; and, Rona Goffen, "Titian's Wives." Paper presented at symposium, *Renaissance Women: Courtly Power and Influence*, San Francisco, 18 May 1996.
 10. Alberti, *Della Famiglia*, 215.
 11. Judith C. Brown, "A Woman's Place Was In The Home: Women's Work in Renaissance Tuscany," in *Rewriting the Renaissance: The Discourses of Sexual Difference in Early Modern Europe*, edited by Margaret W. Ferguson, Maureen Quilligan, and Nancy J. Vickers (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1986), 215.

-
12. La Ronciere, "Tuscan Notables on the Eve of the Renaissance, " 214.
 13. Brown, "A Woman's Place Was in the Home: Women's Work in Renaissance Tuscany," 215.
 14. David Herlihy and Christiane Klapisch-Zuber, *Tuscans and Their Families: A Study of the Florentine Catasto of 1427* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1985), 229.
 15. Herlihy and Klapisch-Zuber, *Tuscans and Their Families*, 229; Margaret R. Miles, "The Virgin's One Bare Breast: Nudity, Gender, and Religious Meaning in Tuscan Early Renaissance Culture,": in *The Expanding Discourse: Feminism and Art History*, edited by Norma Broude and Mary D. Garrard (New York: Harper Collins Publishers, Inc., 1992), 29.
 16. Herlihy and Klapisch-Zuber, *Tuscans and Their Families*, 229.
 17. Gene Brucker, editor, *Two Memoirs of Renaissance Florence: The Diaries of Buonaccorso Pitti and Gregorio Dati* (New York: Harper & Row, 1967), 116-117.
 18. Ibid, 134.
 19. Herlihy and Klapisch-Zuber, *Tuscans and Their Families*, 255.
 20. Richard A. Goldthwaite, *Private Wealth in Renaissance Florence: A Study of Four Families* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1968), 264.
 21. Herlihy and Klapisch-Zuber, *Tuscans and Their Families*, 135.
 22. Ibid, 255.
 23. Christiane Klapisch-Zuber, *Women, Family, and Ritual in Renaissance Italy*, translated by Lydia Cochrane (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985), 114.
 24. Alberti, *Della Famiglia*, 55.
 25. Peter Thomson, *The Italian Renaissance Interior: 1400-1600* (New York: Harry N. Abrams, Inc., 1991), 352.

Chapter 3

Power and Emotion in Imagery: A Renaissance Perspective

Images held tremendous power for the Renaissance viewer in meanings both overt and implied. This power is often lost to the modern viewer for various reasons. Removed from its intended location, isolated, and illuminated by artificial gallery lighting, a Renaissance painting loses the mystical quality, continuity, and powerful statement the work presented as part of the overall pictorial scheme in a candle-lit chapel. In the twentieth century we tend to analyze and interpret, we no longer believe in the magic and mystery of the images. But a viewer in Renaissance Florence knew the power of images; for them, painting "...embodied some of the essence of being of whatever it represented or symbolized..."¹

How can we reconstruct the power or essence embodied by paintings of the Annunciation and the reasons behind the choice to commission this particular image? We must examine what the Renaissance Florentine patron and viewer understood about the theme while remembering that personal interpretation of art is a modern phenomenon. The Renaissance viewer understood that sacred images, like sacred texts, required expert explanation. The use of images, both by individuals and by larger social groups, called for guidance.

Through instructional books, popular from the fourteenth century on, the Renaissance viewer knew the meaning of the many biblical tales depicted by the artists. Books, such as the aforementioned *The Golden Legend* and *The Meditations on the Life of Christ*, guided the viewer through the works, encouraging the audience to focus on the Virgin's life, her feelings, and emotions.² With the knowledge conveyed in such writings, a devout person was able to focus on the spiritual message intended in an image, such as *The Annunciation*, and find inspiration in its power.

In addition to inspirational books, contemporary clergymen lectured on newly personalized aspects of important religious doctrine. This instruction aided the Renaissance audience in more sharply differentiating the various emotional states of the Virgin during the Annunciation.

In his sermon on the Annunciation in 1494, Fra Roberto Caracciolo da Lecce described in intricate detail the Virgin's experiences during the Annunciation.³ Fra Roberto outlined the Virgin's emotional, mental, and spiritual states into a series of mysteries and conditions that stressed a human level of her experience. These conditions were articulated through an artistic vocabulary of movements and expressions. Hence, the fifteenth- or sixteenth-century viewer gazing upon *The Annunciation* by Fra Filippo Lippi (Fig. 18) would understand that the Virgin is experiencing the condition Fra Roberto called *Conturbatio*, or Disquiet, the moment Mary "in her humility was astonished and amazed" by the tremendous message delivered by the Archangel Gabriel.⁴ The

viewer would be able to differentiate this condition from the Virgin's state of *Cogitatio*, Reflection, as may be seen in Lorenzo Monaco's depiction of the scene (Fig. 3) when she "cast in her mind what manner of salutation this should be."⁵ As subtle as these differences may seem now, the Renaissance audience was coached by preachers on the "painters' repertory, and the painters responded within the current emotional categorization of the event."⁶

Just as the pictorial developments of Renaissance painting aided in expressing the emotion of the scene, placing the scene in a contemporary setting also enabled the viewer to react to the image on a more personal level. Renaissance depictions of the Annunciation transformed the ethereal quality that was present in earlier representations. The gold background and floating figures of the Italo-Byzantine tradition exemplified by the *Annunciation*, ca. 1143, found in the Palatine Chapel in Palermo (Fig 10.), created a scene far removed from daily life. This tradition continued in the work of Sienese artists such as Simone Martini (Fig. 19). Working in a gothic style, Martini depicted the *Annunciation* still in the celestial sphere; the figures of Gabriel and Mary are isolated in front of a flat gold ground.

The first monumental shift away from depicting the Annunciation in this distant, heavenly realm is seen in the work of the Florentine artist Giotto (see Fig. 8). Giotto's depiction of the Annunciation in the Arena Chapel is considered pivotal in the use of an architectural setting for the scene as,

...from the fourteenth century on, the touchstone is the conception of the subject as a whole, including its setting, which became more important than the arrangement of the figures.... Where symbolic or purely decorative relationships had sufficed before, it now became necessary to develop means by which space could be suggested and rendered an integral part of the portrayal.⁷

Giotto's *Annunciation* places both the Virgin and the Archangel Gabriel in the bays of an open portico, a device that became, more often than not, the standard representation in Tuscan versions of the scene. Giotto's images are rendered in perspective and give the illusion of space: a feature that is enhanced by the previously discussed curtains, pulled-back and knotted around marble columns, which provide a glimpse into space beyond the scene.

This early representation of an architectural background for the Annunciation does not, however, provide the viewer with the clearly defined, perhaps even specifically identifiable, space of later works. Rendering the scene in a space that is more readily understood by the viewer would have created a more intimate rapport between the image and the worshipper. This, in turn, may enable the viewer to relate more closely to the scene at hand.

Florentine artists of the quattrocento, such as Filippo Lippi, depicted the Annunciation using the developing artistic language of the Italian Renaissance. Filippo Lippi's *Annunciation* (Fig. 18) is placed in a clearly defined, contemporary spatial setting, making use of the artist's knowledge of perspective and realism. In Renaissance representations the event is still divine, but the Annunciation is no longer occurring in the golden realm of heaven; Fra Lippi's *Annunciation*, for

example, is taking place under the portico of what could be a contemporary Florentine church. By taking the event out of the earlier otherworldly setting and immersing the scene in contemporary Florentine surroundings the image becomes more believable, and more understandable, to the viewer.

However paintings were understood on a personal level by individual men and women, they also had a social significance. For the patron, private commissions, such as altarpieces and fresco cycles, in public view demonstrated “to the congregation at large their prominent position in the community, and the awe and respect to which they were entitled by birth or office,”⁸ and by the honor of their family.

Notes

-
1. Bruce Cole, *The Renaissance Artist at Work From Pisano to Titian* (New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, Inc., 1983), 11.
 2. Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend*, translated by Granger Ryan and Helmut Ripperger (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1941); Ragusa, Isa, and Rosalie B. Green, editors, *Meditations of the Life of Christ: An Illustrated Manuscript of the Fourteenth Century*, translated by Isa Ragusa (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1961).
 3. For the following discussion of Fra Roberto's sermon on the Annunciation, I am indebted to Michael Baxandall, *Painting and Experience in Fifteenth Century Italy*, 2nd edition (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990), 49-56.
 4. Ibid., 51.
 5. Ibid.
 6. Ibid., 55.
 7. David M. Robb, "The Iconography of the Annunciation in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries," *Art Bulletin* 18 (March 1936): 485.
 8. Lisa Jardine, *Worldly Goods: A New History of the Renaissance* (New York: Nan A. Talese/Doubleday, 1996), 19.

Chapter 4

The Public Statement of a Private Commission

Can any conclusion be made regarding the connection between the popularity of the image of the Annunciation and the lives of Florentine women? One interesting example of the connection can be seen in an examination of the original commission of the Barbadori-Capponi chapel in Santa Felicita. Much of the art historical interest in the original commission for the Barbadori-Capponi chapel in the Florentine church of Santa Felicita has revolved around the architect to whom the chapel has been attributed, Filippo Brunelleschi. The attribution debate, however, obscures a more interesting problem—the possible intention of the original patron, Bartolomeo di Gheruccio Barbadori.

When Bartolomeo di Gheruccio Barbadori died in 1400, he left provisions in his will for the construction of a chapel to house an existing trecento fresco of *The Annunciation*.¹ This image was located on the interior façade wall of the church in what was probably a copy of the celebrated Santissima Annunziata cult image. The clergy of Santa Felicita were no doubt hoping for a replication of the miracle that occurred at the Santissima Annunziata, as so many were; and, although several quattrocento miracles are reported at the church, there is no tale of a miracle associated with the painting.²

Barbadori's bequest included very specific instructions on the funding for the chapel. In his testament he specified that the monies used to build the

chapel would be the same money that had been used as a dowry for his eldest daughter, Sandra. Upon her death, Sandra's heirs were to be required to use her dowry to fund the construction of a chapel dedicated to the Annunciation. Sandra died in 1418, and the construction of the chapel began in 1419.³

What could have been the possible motivations of Bartolomeo Barbadori's commission of this chapel? One benefit of such a major deed might be the guarantee of a place in heaven for the patron. Another consideration is that, "[I]t is usually assumed that chapels were family places and...[had] something to do with what was happening at the moment in the upper-class family."⁴

Contemporary sources have not revealed what was happening in Barbadori's family at the time of his bequest, but the implications are thought-provoking. Barbadori's choice of building his family chapel at the site of an Annunciation painting could be interpreted as an acknowledgement of or a desire for the sought after highly regarded traits of chastity and fertility within his own family.

In the ideal realm of Florentine thought, Sandra's dowry reflected her marriageable status. To patrician-class Florence, for Sandra to be marriageable implied that she was a chaste and virtuous woman. Sandra married twice in her lifetime; Barbadori's commission may be a reference to Sandra's apparent virtuousness demonstrated by her marriages.

Sandra fulfilled her role as a chastely married female member of the family. But in addition to chastity, motherhood was a highly-regarded virtue

associated with the image of the Annunciation. Sandra did have one son, Calvano di Attaviano, but he was born in 1410,⁵ ten years after the death of her father Barbadori. Therefore, he was unaware that his daughter had also achieved this measure of the ideal woman. Perhaps the motive behind the commission was as a votive offering to ensure the fertility of his daughter.

Research in Northern European art has demonstrated that images of the Annunciation were used as votive offerings in the desire for children and in the celebration of the birth of heirs. Penny Howell Jolly's work on the *Ghent Altarpiece*, for example, has established a tie between the much-awaited birth of Philip the Good's heir and the Annunciation scene.⁶ Similar desires could be motivating factors in Florentine commissions such as Barbadori's.

The original intent of Barbadori's commission is not known; however, this private commission within a public space does invite inquiry. Certainly he felt that monies spent financing religious projects would aid his entry into heaven: this was common practice. As a final resting place, a chapel in his name would ensure that his memory would be honored. But, even more he assured the good name of his family through the use of Sandra's dowry money to construct the chapel dedicated to the Annunciation; therefore, proclaiming to the congregation, and the citizens of Florence, his daughter's virtuous nature and reinforcing the most desired characteristics of womanhood as seen in the ideal woman of the time: The Virgin Mary.

The trecento *Annunciation* in the Barbadori-Capponi chapel is no longer extant. In 1525, the patronage of the chapel was taken over by Lodovico Capponi and dedication changed to the Pieta. The older Annunciation image was brought up-to-date with a new version by Pontormo in ca. 1527-28 (Fig. 20).⁷ However, despite the new dedication to the Pieta, the family never suppressed the original dedication and a small seventeenth-century inscription declares the continued endowment of the cult of the Annunciation.⁸

A brief examination of another patrician class commission in Florence demonstrates a similar desire to display the virtues of one's daughters and honor the family name. The Tomabouni-Tomaquinci chapel in Santa Maria Novella depicts the pious nature of the family as well as their place in Florentine society.

The fresco cycle, commissioned by Giovanni Tomabuoni, contains depictions of various religious scenes. Placed conspicuously within these scenes are members of Tomabuoni's family. For example, portraits of his daughters, Ludovica and Lucrezia Tomabuoni, are found in *The Birth of the Virgin* (Fig. 21) and *The Birth of Saint John the Baptist* (Fig. 16), respectively. The piety and chaste nature of these women was beyond repute as they were represented virtually in the center of these divine scenes.

These images also provided the viewer with a clear concept of the status of the patron, Giovanni Tomabuoni, in Florentine society. Ludovica and Lucrezia are depicted clothed in sumptuous fabrics as they enter the richly appointed

rooms of contemporary Florentine homes. Obviously these women were from a family rich in both the spiritual and the material sense.

Unlike the Barbadori chapel, which was the first chapel to the right as one entered Santa Felicita, the Tornabuoni-Tomaquinci chapel was located in the choir. Separated from the nave by a rood screen until the mid-sixteenth century, only the upper registers of the cycle were easily visible to general public. *The Birth of the Virgin* and *The Birth of Saint John the Baptist* frescoes were located in the lower registers of the chapel; therefore, these images of the chaste and humble Tornabuoni women were constantly visible to the clergy, as was the tremendous project paid for by Giovanni Tornabuoni, all of whom would be remembered in prayer.

Does this necessarily imply that, prior to the destruction of the rood-screen, the images were unknown to the congregation? Even though divided physically from the nave, the choir chapels are part of the church, part of a public space, and could potentially be viewed through various means. Most rood-screens are not solid walls, but contain small openings within a decorative design that would allow for glimpses into the space beyond. Select visitors, allowed into the choir area for various reasons, may have seen the work: artists hired to create an image elsewhere in the choir; craftsmen brought in to repair the structure; or, visiting clergy and important statesmen touring important sites; and so on. It seems probable that even before the choir area was opened to the general congregation, the images of Ludovica and Lucrezia Tornabuoni would

have been known and this private commission would have made a very public statement about the honor of the Tornabuoni family.

Notes

-
1. Howard Saalman, "Form and Meaning at the Barbadori-Capponi Chapel in S. Felicita." *Burlington Magazine* 131 (August 1989): 538, Appendix 1.
 2. Convent records report the appearance of the Archangel Raphael to two nuns in 1424. The angel appeared various times after that as witnessed by "Maestro Albizio de'Nerli, brother of the Carmine and confessor of the nuns." See Saalman, "Form and Meaning at the Barbadori-Capponi Chapel in S. Felicita," 536, n. 27.
 3. Ibid., 538, Appendix 1.
 4. Richard A. Goldthwaite, *The Building of Renaissance Florence: An Economic and Social History* (Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 1980), 99.
 5. Saalman, "Form and Meaning at the Barbadori-Capponi Chapel in S. Felicita," 538, Appendix 1.
 6. Penny Howell Jolly, "More on the Van Eyck Question: Philip the Good of Burgundy, Isabelle of Portugal, and the Ghent Altarpiece," *Oud Holland* 101 (1987): 237-253.
 7. Saalman, "Form and Meaning at the Barbadori-Capponi Chapel in S. Felicita," 535.
 8. Ibid.

Chapter 5

Conclusion

When examining an oft-repeated artistic theme within a society, it is important to focus on the identification of messages or meanings intended by the original patron and the social conditions surrounding the commissions. Often one will find that the image is more than aesthetically pleasing; the image will address certain issues within that society. An examination of the numerous Annunciation images commissioned by patrician class Florentines during the Renaissance served such a purpose; this popular image addressed contemporary society's concerns about the virtue of its women.

The image of the Virgin in the Annunciation represented the ideal woman to the Florentines; the virgin mother remained chaste while she "establishe[d] the child as the destiny of woman..."¹ Establishing these virtues within a wife, mother, and daughter ensured family honor within the community. The placement of these images, representing the virtuousness of the female family members and, as a result, the entire family lineage, allowed entire congregations to understand that *this* was an honorable family.

The use of altarpieces and chapels for prompting such personal statements was not unanimously accepted, however. The Dominican friar, Savonarola, found the use of sacred space and religious themes for personal gain reprehensible. Savonarola's powerful sermons warned against the blurring

of piety and vanity, a trait seen in the Tornabuoni frescoes in Santa Maria Novella, for example. The rich constructed such chapels for their own honor, not the honor of God.² His public outcry against what he considered vain and arrogant displays came to a violent end. In 1498, seven years after being named Prior to the church of San Marco, the city government and the church turned against him. Savonarola was tried for heresy. Found guilty, he was hanged and burned in front of the Palazzo Vecchio in 1498, his diatribes against the contemptuous commissions of the wealthy Florentines silenced.

Savonarola understood the power of the images in the chapels of Florence. He was keenly aware that no longer were these images commissioned solely to celebrate the glory of God, instead they publicly proclaimed the virtuous nature of the patron and his family.

Notes

-
1. Marina Warner, *Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1976), 336.
 2. Marcia B. Hall, "Savonarola's Preaching and the Patronage of Art," in *Christianity and the Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento*, edited by Timothy Verdon and John Henderson (Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1990), 497.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Alberti, Leon Battista. *On Painting*. Translated by John R. Spencer. 2nd edition. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1966.
- . *The Albertis of Florence: Leon Battista Alberti's Della Famiglia*. Translated by Guido A. Guarino. Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 1971.
- Ames-Lewis, Francis. "Fra Filippo Lippi and Flanders." *Zeitschrift fur Kunstgeschichte* 42 (1979): 255-273.
- Aries, Philippe, and Georges Duby, General Editors. *A History of Private Life*. Vol. 3, *Passions of the Renaissance*. Edited by Roger Chartier. Translated by Arthur Goldhammer. Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1989.
- Bainton, Roland H. "Learned Women in the Europe of the Sixteenth Century." In *Beyond Their Sex: Learned Women of the European Past*, edited by Patricia H. Labalme, 117-128. New York: New York University Press, 1980.
- Baxandall, Michael. *Painting and Experience in Fifteenth Century Italy*. 2nd edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990.
- Bayley, C.C. *War and Society in Renaissance Florence: The De Militia of Leonardo Bruni*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1961.
- Beck, James H. "New Notices for Michelozzo." In *Renaissance Studies in Honor of Craig Hugh Smyth*, edited by Andrew Morrogh, Fiorella Superbi Gioffredi, Piero Morselli, Eve Borsook, 23-27. Florence: Giunti Barbera, 1985.
- Bellosi, Luciano. *Giotto: The Complete Works*. Florence: Scala Istituto Fotografico Editoriale, 1981.
- Bergstein, Mary. "Marian Politics in Quattrocento Florence: The Renewed Dedication of Santa Maria del Fiore in 1412." *Renaissance Quarterly* 44 (Winter 1991): 673-719.
- Bertelli, Sergio, Franco Cardini, and Elvira Garbero Zorzi. *The Courts of the Italian Renaissance*. Translated by Mary Fitton and Geoffrey Culverwill. Milan: Arnoldo Mondadori Editore.

- Black, Robert. *Benedetto Accolti and the Florentine Renaissance*. Cambridge, Engl.: Cambridge University Press, 1985.
- Boccaccio, Giovanni. *Concerning Famous Women*. Translated by Guido A. Guarino. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1963.
- Borsi, Franco. *Firenze del Cinquecento*. Rome: Editalia, 1974.
- Brown, Judith C. *In the Shadow of Florence: Provincial Society in Renaissance Pescia*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982.
- . "A Woman's Place was in the Home: Women's Work in Renaissance Tuscany." In *Rewriting the Renaissance: The Discourse of Sexual Difference in Early Modern Europe*, edited by Margaret W. Ferguson, Maureen Quilligan, and Nancy J. Vickers, 206-224. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1986.
- Brucker, Gene, editor. *Two Memoirs of Renaissance Florence: The Diaries of Buonaccorso Pitti and Gregorio Dati*. Translated by Julia Martines. New York: Harper & Row, 1967.
- . *Renaissance Florence*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1969.
- . *The Civic World of Early Renaissance Florence*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1977.
- Burckhardt, Jacob. *The Architecture of the Italian Renaissance*. Translated by James Palmes. Edited by Peter Murray. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985.
- . *The Civilization of the Renaissance in Italy*. Translated by S.G.C. Middlemore. London: Penguin Books, 1990.
- Burke, Peter. *Culture and Society in Renaissance Italy, 1420-1540*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1972.
- Castiglione, Baldassare. *The Book of the Courtier*. Translated by Sir Thomas Hoby. London: J.M. Dent & Sons Ltd., 1928.
- Chadwick, Whitney. *Women, Art, and Society*. London: Thames & Hudson Ltd., 1990.

- Christiansen, Keith. *Italian Painting*. New York: Hugh Lauter Levin Associates, Inc., 1992.
- Clough, Cecil Holdsworth, editor. *Cultural Aspects of the Italian Renaissance: Essays in Honour of Paul Oskar Kristeller*. Manchester: Manchester University Press; New York: A.F. Zambeiri, 1976.
- Cole, Bruce. *The Renaissance Artist at Work From Pisano to Titian*. New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, Inc., 1983.
- Dillenberger, Jane. *Image and Spirit in Sacred and Secular Art*. Edited by Diane Apostolos-Cappadona. New York: Crossroad Publishing Co., 1990.
- Eisenberg, Marvin. *Lorenzo Monaco*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1989.
- Elam, Caroline Mary. "Lorenzo de'Medici and the Urban Development of Renaissance Florence." *Art History* 1 (march 1978): 43-66.
- Ferrante, Joan M. *Woman as Image in Medieval Literature: From the Twelfth Century to Dante*. Durham, N.C.: Labyrinth Press, 1985.
- Fine, Elsa Honig. *Women and Art: A History of Women Painters and Sculptors from the Renaissance to the 20th Century*. Montclair, N.J.: Abner Schram Ltd., 1978.
- Freedberg, S.J. *Painting in Italy: 1500-1600*. 3rd edition. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1993.
- Gadol, Joan. *Leon Battista Alberti: Universal Man of the Early Renaissance*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1969.
- Giedion, Sigfried. *Space, Time, and Architecture: The Growth of a New Tradition*. 5th edition. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1967.
- Gies, Frances and Joseph. *Marriage and the Family in the Middle Ages*. New York: Harper & Row, 1987.
- Gilbert, Creighton E. *Italian Art 1400-1500: Sources and Documents*. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1980.

- Goffen, Rona. "Titian, His Donors, and Sacred Subjects." In *Titian: Prince of Painters*, exhibition catalogue. Edited by Susanna Biadene, 85-93. Venice: Marsilio Editori, 1990.
- . "Titian's Wives." Paper presented at symposium, *Renaissance Women: Courtly Power and Influence*, San Francisco, 18 May 1996.
- Goldthwaite, Richard A. *Private Wealth in Renaissance Florence: A Study of Four Families*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1968.
- . *The Building of Renaissance Florence: An Economic and Social History*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 1980.
- Gottlieb, Carla. "Respiciens per Fenestras: The Symbolism of the Merode Altarpiece." *Oud Holland* 85 (1970): 65-84.
- Hale, John, "In the Empire of Things: How Renaissance Rooms Looked." *Times Literary Supplement* 4628 (13 December 1991): 16.
- . *The Civilization of Europe in the Renaissance*. New York: Atheneum, 1994.
- Hall, Marcia B. "Savonarola's Preaching and the Patronage of Art." In *Christianity and the Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento*, edited by Timothy Verdon and John Henderson, 493-522. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1990.
- Hare Christopher. *The Most Illustrious Ladies of the Italian Renaissance*. 1905. Reprint. Williamstown, Mass.: Corner House Publishers, 1972.
- Harris, Ann Sutherland, and Linda Nochlin. *Women Artists: 1550-1950*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1989.
- Hay, Denys, and John Law. *Italy in the Age of the Renaissance, 1380-1530*. London: Longman Group, 1989.
- Herlihy, David. *Medieval Households*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1985.
- , and Christiane Klapisch-Zuber. *Tuscans and Their Families: A Study of the Florentine Catasto of 1427*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1985.

Heydenreich, Ludwin Heinrich, and Wolfgang Lotz. *Architecture in Italy 1400-1600*. Translated by Mary Hottinger. Baltimore: Penguin Books, 1974.

The Holy Bible. King James Version. Philadelphia: The National Bible Press, n.d.

Hope, Charles. "Altarpieces and The Requirements of Patrons." In *Christianity and the Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento*, edited by Timothy Verdon and John Henderson, 535-571. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1990.

Jardine, Lisa. *Worldly Goods: A New History of the Renaissance*. New York: Nan A. Talese/Doubleday, 1996.

Jolly, Penny Howell. "On the Meaning of the *Virgin Mary Reading*: Attributed to Antonello da Messina." *The Journal of the Walters Art Gallery* 40 (1982): 25-35.

-----, "More on the Van Eyck Question: Philip the Good of Burgundy, Isabelle of Portugal, and the Ghent Altarpiece." *Oud Holland* 101 (1987): 237-253.

Jordan, Constance. *Renaissance Feminism: Literary Texts and Political Models*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1990.

Kelly, Joan. "Did Women Have a Renaissance?" In *Women, History & Theory: The Essays of Joan Kelly*, 19-50. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984.

Kelso, Ruth. *Doctrine for the Lady of the Renaissance*. Urbana, Ill.: University of Illinois Press, 1956.

Kent, Francis William. *Household and Lineage in Renaissance Florence: The Family Life of the Capponi, Ginori, and Rucellai*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1977.

-----, "A Letter of 1476 from Antonio di Tuccio Manetti Mentioning Brunelleschi." *Burlington Magazine* 121 (October 1979): 648-649.

-----, "Palaces, Politics, and Society in Fifteenth Century Florence." *I Tatti Studies II* (1987): 41-70.

-----, and Patricia Simons, editors. *Patronage, Art, and Society in Renaissance Italy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987.

- King, Catherine. "Medieval and Renaissance Matrons, Italian-Style." *Zeitschrift fur Kunstgeschichte* 55 (1992): 372-393.
- King, Margaret L. "Book-Lined Cells: Women and Humanism in the Early Italian Renaissance." In *Beyond Their Sex: Learned Women of the European Past*, edited by Patricia H. Labalme, 66-90. New York: New York University Press, 1980.
- , and Albert Rabil, Jr., editors. *Her Immaculate Hand: Selected Works By and About the Female Humanists of Quattrocento Italy*. Binghamton, N.Y., 1983.
- . *Women of the Renaissance*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991.
- Klapisch-Zuber, Christiane. *Women, Family, and Ritual in Renaissance Italy*. Translated by Lydia Cochrane. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985.
- Kostof, Spiro. *A History of Architecture: Settings and Rituals*. New York: Oxford University Press, Inc., 1995.
- Kristeller, Paul Oskar. "Learned Women of Early Modern Italy: Humanists and University Scholars." In *Beyond Their Sex: Learned Women of the European Past*, edited by Patricia H. Labalme, 91-116. New York: New York University Press, 1980.
- La Ronciere, Charles de. "Tuscan Notables on the Eve of the Renaissance." In *A History of Private Life*. Vol. 2, *Revelations of the Medieval World*, 157-309. Edited by Philippe Aries and Georges Duby. Translated by Arthur Goldhammer. Cambridge, Mass.: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1988.
- Lane, Barbara G. *The Altar and the Altarpiece: Sacramental Themes in Early Netherlandish Painting*. New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1984.
- Lavin, Marilyn Aronberg. *The Place of Narrative: Mural Decoration in Italian Churches, 431-1600*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1990.
- Lemaitre, Alain J. *Florence and the Renaissance: The Quattrocento*. Edited by Jean-Claude Dubost and Jean-Francois Gonthier. Paris: Editions Pierre Terrail, 1993.

- Levin, Carole, and Jeanie Watson, editors. *Ambiguous Realities: Women in the Middle Ages and Renaissance*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1987.
- L'officina della maniera: Varieta e fierezza nell'arte fiorentina del Cinquecento fra le due repubbliche 1494-1530*. Exhibition catalogue. Venice: Marsilio Editori, 1996.
- Lotz, Wolfgang. *Studies in Italian Renaissance Architecture*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1977.
- Maclean, Ian. *The Renaissance Notion of Woman: A Study in the Fortunes of Scholasticism and Medical Science in European Intellectual Life*. Cambridge, Engl.: Cambridge University Press, 1980.
- Manikosi, Adam. "The Sad Consequences of a Florentine Nobleman's Marriage." In *Renaissance Studies in Honor of Craig Hugh Smyth*, edited by Andrew Morrogh, Fiorella Superbi Gioffredi, Piero Morselli, and Eve Borsook, 155-161. Florence: Giunti Barbera, 1985.
- Maulde la Claviere, R. de. *The Women of the Renaissance: A Study in Feminism*. Translated by George Herbert Ely. New York: G. Putman's Sons, 1905.
- Migiel, Marilyn, editor. *Refiguring Woman: Perspectives on Gender and the Italian Renaissance*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1991.
- Miles, Margaret R. *Image as Insight: Visual Understanding in Western Christianity and Secular Culture*. Boston: Beacon Press, 1985.
- , "The Virgin's One Bare Breast: Nudity, Gender, and Religious Meaning in Tuscan Early Renaissance Culture." In *The Expanding Discourse: Feminism and Art History*, edited by Norma Broude and Mary D. Garrard, 27-37. New York: Harper Collins Publishers, Inc., 1992.
- Molho, Anthony. "Visions of the Florentine Family in the Renaissance." *Journal of Modern History* 50 (June 1978): 304-311.
- Murray, Peter. *The Architecture of the Italian Renaissance*. London: B.T. Batsford Ltd., 1963. Reprint. London: Thames and Hudson, Ltd., 1988.
- Newbigin, Nerida. "The Word Made Flesh: The *Rappresentazioni* of Mysteries and Miracles in Fifteenth-Century Florence." In *Christianity and the*

- Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento*, edited by Timothy Verdon and John Henderson, 361-375. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1990.
- Nigro, Salvatore S. *Pontormo: Paintings and Frescoes*. Translated by Karin H. Ford. New York: Harry N. Abrams, Inc., 1994.
- Pullan, Brian. *A History of Early Renaissance Italy: From the Mid-Thirteenth to the Mid-Fifteenth Century*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1972.
- Purtle, Carol J. *The Marian Paintings of Jan van Eyck*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1982.
- Rabb, Theodore K. "Patterns of Power Among Renaissance Women." Paper presented at symposium, *Renaissance Women: Courtly Power and Influence*, San Francisco, 18 May 1996.
- Ragusa, Isa, and Rosalie B. Green, editors. *Meditations on the Life of Christ: An Illustrated Manuscript of the Fourteenth Century*. Translated by Isa Ragusa. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1961.
- Robb, David M. "The Iconography of the Annunciation in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries." *Art Bulletin* 18 (March 1936): 480-526.
- Rose, Mary Beth, editor. *Women in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance: Literary and Historical Perspectives*. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1986.
- Rowlands, Eliot W. "Filippo Lippi's Tarquinia Madonna: Additional Evidence for a Proposed Flemish Source." *Rutgers Art Review* 5 (Spring 1984): 1-7.
- Saalman, Howard. "Form and Meaning at the Barbadori-Capponi Chapel in S. Felicità." *Burlington Magazine* 131 (August 1989): 532-539.
- Sach, Hannelore. *The Renaissance Woman*. New York: McGraw Hill, 1971.
- San Juan, Rose Marie. "Mythology, Women, and Renaissance Private Life: The Myth of Eurydice in Italian Furniture Painting." *Art History* 15 (June 1992): 127-145.
- Schiller, Gertrud. *Iconography of Christian Art*. Vol. 1. Translated by Janet Seligman. Greenwich, Conn.: New York Graphic Society, Ltd., 1971.

- Sears, Olivia. "Women Poets and War in the Italian Renaissance." Paper presented at the *Istituto Italiano di Cultura*, San Francisco, 20 September 1995.
- Simons, Patricia. "Women in Frames." In *The Expanding Discourse: Feminism and Art History*, edited by Norma Broude and Mary D. Garrard, 39-57. New York: Harper Collins Publishers, Inc., 1992.
- Simonson, Anne. "The *Merode Triptych*: Issues of Painting Practice" (unpublished paper).
- Steinberg, Leo. "Pontormo's Capponi Chapel." *Art Bulletin* 56 (September 1974): 385-399.
- Thomson, David. *Renaissance Architecture: Critics, Patrons, Luxury*. Manchester, Engl.: Manchester University Press, 1993.
- Thornton, Peter. *The Italian Renaissance Interior: 1400-1600*. New York: Harry N. Abrams, Inc., 1991.
- Toman, Rolf, editor. *The Art of the Italian Renaissance: Architecture, Sculpture, Painting, Drawing*. Translated by Deborah ffoulkes, Fiona Hulse, Michael Hulse, Michael Scuffil and Karen Williams. San Diego, Calif.: Thunder Bay Press, 1995.
- Trexler, Richard C. *Public Life in Renaissance Florence*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1980.
- Vasari, Giorgio. *Lives of the Artists Volume 1*. Translated by George Bull. London: Penguin Books, 1987.
- Ventrone, Paola. "Thoughts on Florentine Fifteenth-Century Religious Spectacle." In *Christianity and the Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento*, edited by Timothy Verdon and John Henderson, 405-412. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1990.
- Verdon, Timothy. "Christianity, the Renaissance, and the Study of History: Environments of Experience and Imagination." *Christianity and the Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento*, edited by Timothy Verdon and John Henderson, 1-37. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1990.

- Voragine, Jacobus de. *The Golden Legend*. Translated by Granger Ryan and Helmut Ripperger. New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1941.
- Wackemagel, Martin. *The World of the Florentine Renaissance Artist: Projects and Patrons, Workshop and Art Market*. 1938. Translated by Alison Luchs. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1981.
- Warner, Marina. *Alone of All her Sex: The Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1976.
- Weil, Mark S. "The Relationship of the Cornaro Chapel to Mystery Plays and Italian Court Theatre." In *"All the World's a Stage..." Art and Pageantry in the Renaissance and Baroque*. Edited by Barbara Wisch and Susan Scott Munshower, 459-486. Part 2. *Theatrical Spectacle and Spectacular Theatre*. Papers in Art History for The Pennsylvania State University. Vol. 6. University Park, Penn.: Pennsylvania State University, 1990.
- Weinstein, Donald. "The Myth of Florence." In *Florentine Studies: Politics and Society in Renaissance Florence*, edited by Nicolai Rubinstein, 15-44. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1968.
- , and Rudolph M. Bell. *Saints & Society: The Two Worlds of Western Christendom, 1000-1700*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982.
- Welch, Evelyn. *Art and Society in Italy 1350-1500*. Oxford, Engl.: Oxford University Press, 1997,
- White, John. *Art and Architecture in Italy 1250-1400*. 3rd edition. Pelican History of Art. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1993.
- Wiesner, Merry E. *Women in the Sixteenth Century: A Bibliography*. St. Louis: Center for Reformation Research, 1983.
- Wittkower, Rudolf. *Idea and Image: Studies in the Italian Renaissance*. London: Thames and Hudson, 1978.
- Zirpolo, Lilian. "Botticelli's *Primavera*: A Lesson for the Bride." In *The Expanding Discourse: Feminism and Art History*, edited by Norma Broude and Mary D. Garrard, 101-109. New York: Harper Collins Publishers, Inc., 1992.

1. Santissima Annunziata. Facade. Florence. (Source: Author.)

2. Santa Trinità. Facade. Florence. (Source: Author.)

3. Lorenzo Monaco. *Annunciation Altarpiece*. ca. 1422-23. Bartolini Salimbeni Chapel, Santa Trinita, Florence. (Source: Eisenberg, Marvin. *Lorenzo Monaco*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1989. Plate 120.)

4. Wall Painting. Early 4th century. Catacombs of Priscilla, Rome. (Source: Schiller, Gertrud. *Iconography of Christian Art*. Vol. 1. Translated by Janet Seligman. Greenwich, Conn.: New York Graphic Society, Ltd., 1971. Plate 69.)

5. Italian Master. *Annunciation*. Second half of 14th century. Fresco. Church of San Marco, Florence. (Source: Purtle, Carol J. *The Marian Paintings of Jan van Eyck*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1982. Plate 15.)

6. Lorenzo Monaco. *Annunciation Altarpiece*. ca. 1422-23. Detail. Bartolini Salimbeni Chapel, Santa Trinita, Florence. (Source: Eisenberg, Marvin. *Lorenzo Monaco*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1989. Plate 120.)

7. Andrea del Sarto. *Annunciation*. ca. 1512. Detail. Galleria Palatina, Florence.
(Source: *L'officina della maniera: Varieta e fierezza nell'arte fiorentina del Cinquecento fra le due repubbliche 1494-1530*. Exhibition catalogue. Venice: Marsilio Editori, 1996. Plate 48.)

8. Giotto. *Annunciation*. 1305. Fresco. Arena Chapel, Padua. (Source: Bellosi, Luciano. *Giotto: The Complete Works*. Florence: Scala Istituto Fotografico Editoriale, 1981. Plates 69, 70.)

9. Giotto. Interior of Arena Chapel. 1305. Padua. (Source: Bellosi, Luciano. *Giotto: The Complete Works*. Florence: Scala Istituto Fotografico Editoriale, 1981. Plate 54.)

10. Anonymous. *Annunciation*. ca. 1143. Mosaic. Palatine Chapel, Palermo.
(Source: Schiller, Gertrud. *Iconography of Christian Art*. Vol. 1. Translated by Janet Seligman. Greenwich, Conn.: New York Graphic Society, Ltd., 1971. Plate 97.)

11. Titian. *The Miracle of the Jealous Husband*. Mid-16th century. Fresco. Scuola del Santo, Padua. (Source: Goffen, Rona. "Titian, His Donors, and Sacred Subjects," in *Titian: Prince of Painters*, exhibition catalogue. Edited by Susanna Biadene, 85-93. Venice: Marsilio Editori, 1990. Plate 1.)

12. Coppo di Marcovaldo. *Madonna and Child*. ca. 1265. Panel. San Martino ai Servi, Orvieto. (Source: Snyder, James. *Medieval Art: Painting, Sculpture, Architecture, 4-14th Century*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc. Page 451, fig. 578.)

13. Filippo Lippi. *Madonna with Child and Angels*. ca. 1455. Panel. Uffizi Gallery, Florence. (Source: Pescio, Claudio. *Gli Uffizi: Nuova Guida Completa*. 1992-93 edition. Florence: Bonechi-Edizioni "Il Turismo." Page 51.)

14. Andrea del Sarto. *Assumption of the Virgin*. 1526-29. Panel. Pitti Gallery, Florence. (Source: Hartt, Frederick. *History of Italian Renaissance Art: Painting, Sculpture, Architecture*. 3rd edition. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1987. Plate 77.)

15. Michelangelo (attributed to). *Madonna and Child with the Infant Baptist and Angels* (unfinished). Early 1490's. National Gallery, London. (Source: Braham, Allan. *Italian Paintings of the Sixteenth Century*. London: William Collins Sons and Co. Ltd., 1985. Plate 3.)

16. Domenico Ghirlandaio. *Birth of Saint John the Baptist*. Detail. 1480. Fresco. Santa Maria Novella, Florence. (Source: Thornton, Peter. *The Italian Renaissance Interior: 1400-1600*. New York: Harry N. Abrams, Inc., 1991. Plate 35.)

17. Andrea del Sarto. *Birth of the Virgin*. 1513. Fresco. Santissima Annunziata, Florence. (Source: Thornton, Peter. *The Italian Renaissance Interior: 1400-1600*. New York: Harry N. Abrams, Inc., 1991. Plate 165.)

18. Filippo Lippi. *The Annunciation*. ca. 1440. Tempera on wood. (Source: Christiansen, Keith. *Italian Painting*. New York: Hugh Lauter Levin Associates, Inc., 1992. Page 82.)

19. Simone Martini. *Annunciation*. 1333. Panel. Uffizi Gallery, Florence. (Source: Hartt, Frederick. *History of Italian Renaissance Art: Painting, Sculpture, Architecture*. 3rd edition. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1987. Plate 14.)

20. Pontormo. *Annunciation*. ca. 1527-28. Fresco. Barbadori-Capponi Chapel, Santa Felicita, Florence. (Source: Nigro, Salvatore S. *Pontormo: Paintings and Frescoes*. Translated by Karin H. Ford. New York: Harry N. Abrams, Inc., 1994. Plate IX₂.)

21. Domenico Ghirlandaio. *Birth of the Virgin*. ca. 1485-90. Fresco. Santa Maria Novella, Florence. (Source: Toman, Rolf, editor. *The Art of the Italian Renaissance: Architecture, Sculpture, Painting, Drawing*. Translated by Deborah Foulkes, Fiona Hulse, Michael Hulse, Michael Scuffil and Karen Williams. San Diego, Calif.: Thunder Bay Press, 1985. Page 289.)