1997

Framing Greater China: A case study of a Chinese satellite TV news channel

Jia-yu Jeng
San Jose State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.sjsu.edu/etd_theses

Recommended Citation

Jeng, Jia-yu, "Framing Greater China: A case study of a Chinese satellite TV news channel" (1997).
Master's Theses. 1582.
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.31979/etd.xmfj-7ggp>
https://scholarworks.sjsu.edu/etd_theses/1582

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Master's Theses and Graduate Research at SJSU ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of SJSU ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact scholarworks@sjsu.edu.

INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI

**A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700 800/521-0600**

**FRAMING GREATER CHINA:
A CASE STUDY OF A CHINESE SATELLITE TV NEWS CHANNEL**

**A Thesis
Presented to
The Faculty of the School of Journalism
and Mass Communications
San Jose State University**

**In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Science**

**by
Jia-yu Jeng
December 1997**

UMI Number: 1388200

UMI Microform 1388200
Copyright 1998, by UMI Company. All rights reserved.

**This microform edition is protected against unauthorized
copying under Title 17, United States Code.**

UMI
300 North Zeeb Road
Ann Arbor, MI 48103

© 1997

Jia-yu Jeng

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

APPROVED FOR THE SCHOOL OF JOURNALISM
AND MASS COMMUNICATIONS

Dr. Zhou He

Dr. Bill Tillighast

Dr. William Briggs

APPROVED FOR THE UNIVERSITY

ABSTRACT

FRAMING GREATER CHINA: A CASE STUDY OF A CHINESE SATELLITE TV NEWS CHANNEL

by Jia-yu Jeng

This research was a case study of the news channel of Chinese Television Network (CTN), a vernacular (Mandarin-speaking) satellite news channel since 1994 aimed at broadcasting international news to Greater China.

Staff interviews and the observations of the researcher's revealed that CTN was not a successful case yet because of the limited audience and market, the lack of common consent about the pan-Chinese perspective, and the financial crisis.

The content analysis and framing analysis showed that CTN did adopt more neutral and fair frames than local news organizations, and it tried to provide more international news and news about all Chinese. However, CTN did not have enough staff and resources to support and realize its ideals.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank all the people at CTN that shared their time and experiences with me. In particular, I would like to give my appreciation to Shi Shen-lin and Cheng Hou for their thoughtful and sincere answers.

Thanks to all of my advisors who offered me words of encouragement and suggestions. In particular, I would like to thank Dr. Zhou He for his e-mails and Dr. Bill Tillinghast for his clear discernment and fast feedback.

Finally I would like to thank my family--my parents, sisters, and Tony. They provided me with material and spiritual support.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
1 INTRODUCTION	1
2 LITERATURE REVIEW	4
3 METHODOLOGY	29
4 RESULTS	38
Tables	53
5 DISCUSSION	58
REFERENCES	66
APPENDICES	69

Chapter I

Introduction

With the revolutionized development of communication technologies, information transmitted at ever-greater speed and volume across national frontiers conjures up the image of a global village whose residents are closely linked as never before. Many people expect to pick up newspapers and read about the activities of U.S. military in other countries, to turn on television and watch the performance of the Tokyo stock market, or to listen to the radio about what happens to the cows in the United Kingdom or the pigs in Taiwan. However, the dazzling image is misleading in suggesting the existence of a worldwide community sharing the same information and rights as residents of a global village do. Technology cannot originate messages, nor can it decide who has them. Even more people in other parts of the world expect to have the actions and situations of their people or their countries understood correctly and recognized by the international society. That is partly why there are more and more news organizations in less developed countries trying to provide their viewpoints on international affairs.

In the process of media internationalization or globalization, many potential consequences have emerged. The fact that television news has been broadcast through satellites to a large area without the limitations of national borders and laws especially causes people's worries and criticisms. In an effort

to reduce consequences such as cultural imperialism and news monopoly, many alternative global news organizations and regional news exchanges have started to compete on the same global stage. Moreover, media regionalism or even sub-regionalism also rises in some regions where people share proximate geographical locations, similar cultural background, or intertwined interests. For example, Japan's NHK has been planning to become a global news center in Asia, while the Middle East Broadcasting Center has targeted 300 million Arabic-speaking viewers in the Gulf region.

This kind of trend is especially noteworthy in a cultural China--made up of the societies populated predominantly by cultural and ethnic Chinese in mainland China, Taiwan, Hong Kong, and sometimes Singapore (Tu, 1992, p. 12). Because of the prosperous economy (especially in mainland China recently), political changes (Hong Kong's return to China in 1997), and increasing economic, societal, and political interdependence in mainland China, Taiwan, and Hong Kong (defined as Greater China in this research), many media owners and workers in the three societies have expanded their target audience to people in the "three places of both sides of the Taiwan Strait."

Moreover, with the development of satellite TV, the deregulation of satellite broadcasting in Taiwan, and the regulating difficulties in satellite reception in mainland China, some satellite TV stations have been established and become very popular in these Chinese societies. Partly thanks

to the simultaneity and wide scope of satellite TV coverage, some 24-hour Mandarin-speaking news channels are also developing and changing the news landscape in Greater China. Does the rise of these kinds of vernacular TV news channels serve as a reaction to the prevalence of mainstream international news organizations as those alternative news agencies did? Do they wish to provide international news through the eyes of Chinese people? Does the news they provide frame an image of Greater China from a pan-Chinese perspective for the audience? Or what other new functions do they serve? These are some main questions this study aims to explore through content analysis and in-depth interviews.

The rapid development of media in Greater China and the frequent interchange of media and people within Greater China has just happened in recent years, while the influences and functions they have had or may have are expected to be significant and different from the traditional media. Few studies have been done on the subject of regional satellite TV, and there is no academic research available that is directly related to the development of vernacular satellite TV news channels in Greater China. Thus conducting research that examines the operation and characteristics of those new media both from the perspective of the news organizations and the news content itself, is meaningful and helpful to the understanding and studying of new media in Greater China, as well as to the enhancement of knowledge about international communication.

Chapter II

Literature Review

From Globalization to Regionalization

Globalization, internationalization, and transnationalization

The trend of globalization has been examined by many contemporary scholars. Robertson mentioned that the Oxford Dictionary of New Words defines global consciousness as receptiveness to (and understanding of) cultures other than one's own, often as part of an appreciation of world socio-economic and ecological issues (1991, p. 133). Robertson thought such a use had been much influenced by McLuhan's idea of the global village. McLuhan reflected and shaped media's attempt to consolidate the idea of the global community. On the other hand, the media fully acknowledge the nationality of particular cultures. According to Anthony Giddens (1990), globalization is a primary result of modernity. He thought that globalization was more than a diffusion of Western institutions across the world in which other cultures were crushed. Globalization "is a process of uneven development that fragments as it coordinates... introduces new forms of world interdependence in which, once again there are no 'Others'" (Giddens, 1990, p. 175).

In communication literature, international communication, global communication, and transnational communication are often used to discuss the communication activities that happen on an international scale, and the terms of internationalization, globalization, and transnationalization are

often mixed to describe and analyze the phenomenon and influences of these kinds of communication activities. To be more specific, in a so-called information society, the messages are transmitted across long distances with relative ease, and the access to messages stemming from spatially remote sources can be instantaneous. The reordering of space and time brought about by the development of the media is part of a broader set of processes that have transformed and are still transforming the modern world. These processes are commonly described as internationalization, globalization, or transnationalization. These terms generally refer to the growing interconnectedness of different parts of the world, a process that gives rise to complex forms of interaction and interdependence among countries (Thompson, 1995, p. 149).

In McQuail's Mass Communication Theory (1994), the focus is on the question of potential cultural effects stemming from this internationalization. McQuail noted that the process of cultural transnationalization, which is assumed to be taking place, has a variety of meanings. Aside from the observable trend towards interconnected infrastructures for reception and multinational ownership and operation, it refers both to the dissemination of certain broad kinds of media cultural content and to some potential effects on a receiving culture. As for the sources of this internationalization movement, he stated that the most notable resources are the greatly increased capacity to transmit sounds and

moving images at low costs across frontiers and around the world, overcoming limits of time and space; and the rise of global media business and markets, which provide the organizational framework and driving force for globalization.

Globalization, internationalization, or transnationalization is especially viewed as a process or trend that results from the more and more frequent international communication activities. Sepstrup (1989) stressed the different characteristics of the product transmitted and consumed in international media flow. He pointed out the distinction between international media content as sent, content as actually received, and real consequences for the receiving culture. International content can be transmitted in different ways such as multilateral exchange or a bilateral flow. These distinctions may matter considerably for the type and degree of transnational flow that occurs and for its consequences. Sepstrup also stated that some aspects of transnationalization are not easy to observe, especially the widespread adoption of, or adaptation to, foreign cultural models in domestic media production. Basically, his idea of internationalization or transnationalization stressed the cultural impact that foreign media content might have on domestic receivers.

In Mowlana's (1996) definition of internationalization, international communication must combine national, international, and intercultural dimensions. The internationalization process consists of the transfer of

"values, attitudes, and technologies as well as the structure of institutions" responsible for promoting or inhibiting such messages among and between nations and cultures. He noted that the activity of internationalization transcends national boundaries to blanket other countries' operations and gain insight into news and different cultural schemes, and it also creates an international or global symbolic environment in which the conduct of international political and economic behavior must take place (p. 69). In his view, what is needed now is to place basic human principles on the main agenda. These principles include the prevention of war and the promotion of peace; respect for culture, tradition, and values; promotion of human rights and dignity; and finally, "preservation of the home, human association, family, and community" (p. 70).

When discussing media internationalization in China, Chan (1994) also viewed media content as a cultural product. Chan defined media internationalization as the process by which the ownership, structure, production, distribution, or content of a country's media is influenced by foreign media interests, culture, and markets. It can be examined either from the perspective of the country that imports foreign media culture or from that of the exporting country. In terms of the two different perspectives, the internationalized and the internationalizing are "two sides of the same coin" (p. 71).

Although mainland China, Taiwan and Hong Kong share a common cultural background, the ethnic awareness has been diluted by the mixture of a variety of origins, linguistic cohesiveness is threatened by different dialects, historical consciousness has been undermined by varying interpretations of "China," and world views have been changed by the radically different belief and political systems. Even after Hong Kong's return to China in 1997, it is still a "special region" under China for at least 50 years. Therefore, the communication activities among the three Chinese societies are also viewed as a special kind of international communication in this research.

Debates in the process of globalization

In the process of media globalization, the ideal of a global village is far from being reached. Many people have noticed and criticized the control power of the mainstream media in dominant countries in the international information flow. Among those criticisms, cultural imperialism or media imperialism is most discussed.

Cultural Imperialism believers stated that the dominance of Anglo-American countries on the global stage can be traced back to the nineteenth century when a large part of the world was controlled from a few centers of power. Then the world functioned as a single economic and political system, with the European colonial powers at the center and their colonies at the periphery. In the flow of news, movies, or TV programs around the world, the new centers are London, Paris, and New York (and in some ways, Tokyo),

and the periphery still are Africa, Latin America, and Asia. Schiller (1971), one of the "cultural imperialism" proponents, emphasized the "emerging imperial network" role of the United States (p. 3). Elliott and Golding (1974) also claimed that "developing countries were brought within the common cultural hegemony of western capitalism" by the international media system (p. 230). For many people, the dominant Western countries are using information to maintain a global system of dominance and exploitation: cultural dominance works as imperialism.

In addition to the theory of cultural imperialism, other theories, such as cultural dependency and asymmetric cultural development theory, attempt to provide different perspectives on the imbalance of the global information flow. No matter what theory, some basic aspects, such as the advantage of English-speaking people and the predominance of Western ideology, have been seriously discussed.

One thing the dominant countries have been accused of is the indiscriminate importation of Western values through media content which may also hamper the development of the domestic media of developing countries as well as undermine traditional national and religious values without providing new sources of community cohesion. As many Middle Easterners see it, such a free flow of the lifestyle and socialization of urban and younger people set the stage for inevitable confrontation of the old ruling elites and the new generation. "This conflict clearly manifested itself in the

Islamic Revolution in Iran and in the continuing protests against the cultural domination of the West elsewhere in the region" (Mowlana, 1996, p. 87).

Another debate concerns media technology. The new communication technology ranges from satellites and supercomputers, where the Western leadership is still strong , to the dazzling array of miniaturized consumer products that now come mostly from Asian countries but still are developed with the Western market in mind. It is the technology that jars the cultural senses in even the most isolated corners of the world. Because of the huge size of the Western market and the possession of technological knowledge and infrastructure, most technologies are invented with the needs of the West in mind and most technological skills and equipments are controlled in the hands of the West.

The news values that have been adopted and shaped by mainstream news media are also a focus of the debates in international information flow. From different angles, the global news system can be both surprisingly large and surprisingly small at the same time. It is large because it covers almost the entire planet; it is small because the global news production and distribution is dominated by a handful of global news organizations. Besides, most news agencies are in the industrialized North and democratic West, their reporting sources are unevenly distributed because they put their resources where their revenues and customers are, and their reporters gravitate toward the more liveable spots, cities with good telecommunication

and air travel links, and countries with liberal news policy and strong links to their home countries.

News values are very important because they are adopted by editors to decide what news should be left out, and what should be included. A lack of agreement on what kinds of people, places, and events ought to be singled out as newsworthy should be reasonably expected, but because of the unique influence of Western media around the world, it is usually the Western news values that are presented in the global news flow.

Some studies about news values in major U.S. news organizations show that politics and economics, proximity or regionalism, national involvement, elites, disruption, and skill in using media are the most common news values. According to these values, it is not hard to understand why many developing countries always complain that the volume of news about developing countries is a lot less than that about developed countries, and the news stories about developing countries always emphasize disasters, riots, or uncivilized activities, and ignore the progress and respectable cultural characteristics.

In the Chinese community, those factors of international communication also exist. For the past four decades, the international discourse in the Chinese community has unquestionably been shaped more by the mainstream international news organizations than by Chinese media themselves. Chinese media often quote sources from the U.S. or Japanese

media even when the events happen in Chinese societies. This kind of phenomenon has been criticized by many Chinese scholars, as well as by the media themselves.

Regionalization

Regionalization, regionalism, and regional communication often appear in the literature that discusses globalization or internationalization to describe the trend of regionalizing in the international media environment. In terms of its transnational characteristics, regionalization can also be viewed as a kind of internationalization because it involves communication in more than one country. In terms of the global communication system, regionalization is regionally oriented because it only emphasizes some part of the world and its main target audience is within a specific region (Europe, Latin America, the Middle East, or Asia) on the global map.

Some studies mix regionalization with localization, which focuses on the domestic localization of media content, especially news. Wallis (1990) called these kinds of local organizations schizophrenic local news stations, which provide both a localization and an internationalization of the news and successfully establish their special status.

Boyd-Barrett (1980) used regionalization to analyze the world news agencies' trend to differentiate their services between markets, or tailor them to meet specific client requirements, either individual clients or, more usually, clients of specific countries or geographical regions. He observed that

the main facets of this trend are the general imbalance of world agency resources and services in favor of the world agencies' domestic markets. This would constitute an example of regionalization and, more usually meant, the extent to which news agency content is tailored for specific foreign markets.

The first kind of regionalization can be viewed as a response or reaction to the dominance of the major global news providers. As mentioned earlier, the amount of news that is related to regions other than the West is rather limited, and the angles of the news are often misleading or unfair. If the global agencies try to compete with or to substitute for national or regional agencies, it is very unlikely that many countries would find this politically acceptable. It is also doubtful whether the global news agencies would do as effective a job as national or regional news organizations in terms of providing enough local news and meeting local audience's needs.

The second kind of regionalization is the provision of additional international news that is of special relevance to that region. The major global news agencies have argued that they always provide regionalized services for their world markets and the regionalized news constitutes a large proportion of their news. A few studies show that the regionalization for developing countries has increased in response to client complaints or to the uncomfortable glare of criticism on the issue. However, there are differences between them in the extent to which they regionalize and the areas of the world for which each agency concentrates its regionalization efforts (Boyd-

Barrett, 1980).

Mowlana (1996) used regionalism to describe the trend of smaller culturally defined communities gathered together to establish their own channels. In the example of Europe, regionalism as a defensive ideology has often been directed against what is perceived as excessive centralization of national broadcasting rather than against non-European programming, traditionally from the United States and increasingly from Japan. The efforts of European regions, communities, and nationalities to create their own media have resulted in a wide variety of television systems, and regional television broadcasting in the United Kingdom, Italy and Germany is based on combinations of regional languages, commercial interests and strong regional structure.

Friedland (1992) noticed the rise of regional news organizations. He observed that while CNN and WSTV compete directly on the global stage, regional news organizations are jockeying for position in Europe, Latin America, Asia and the Middle East (p. 30). Among these, some are public service broadcasters with a political or cultural mission, and others are commercial enterprises. He said the world news system would eventually consist of a series of alliances and joint ventures between the global networks and regionals, and perhaps a series of consortia among the regionals themselves.

From the perspective of regionalization, the increasing communication activities among mainland China, Taiwan and Hong Kong can be viewed as sub-regional communication in a global communication context because their major target audience is Chinese people in the three places on both sides of the Taiwan Strait. Whether they can become alternatives to the mainstream global news organizations, or what new functions they can serve are worth examining.

The development of regional TV news

Thanks to the development of satellites and the rise of regionalization, many media have started to utilize satellites to develop regional news channels to broadcast localized international news. Some successful examples include:

1. Nippon Hoso Kyokai: In 1991, NHK abandoned plans for its own worldwide 24-hour news service--Global News Network--that was to compete with CNN and BCC. Then it decided to strengthen its Asian network rather than abandon the GNN plan completely. A new Asian center has been set up in Japan, with bureaus in many other Asian countries. Its first step is to strengthen its network in Asia and then to expand its news service to the rest of the world. The first goal is to supply Asian countries with international news and to supply other countries with news of Asia.

2. Euronews: There are two satellite news operations in Europe. One of them is Euronews, the project of the European Community. Euronews began

satellite broadcasting in six languages in 1993 to people in Europe, with spillover to the Middle East and North Africa. The EC has agreed to provide part of the fund, and the rest will come from advertising and sponsorships.

3. Sky News: At the other end of the European spectrum is Rupert Murdoch's Sky News, the news service of his Sky channel, which began broadcasting in 1984. Sky News is a purely commercial enterprise launched in 1991. Later, it merged with British Satellite Broadcasting to become British Sky Broadcasting. Sky News has quickly become a popular alternative to the state-owned agencies.

4. The Middle East Broadcasting Center: MBC is the most significant success that is aiming at specific language communities. It has targeted 300 million Arabic-speaking viewers in the Gulf region, the Indian subcontinent, and Africa. MBC is the first Arab-language network to open a Jerusalem bureau. Its aims are to spread pro-Western Arab political views throughout the Mideast and to broaden its worldwide news-gathering capacity. It provides a successful model for vernacular broadcasting.

5. Star TV: Since April 1990, Hong Kong's Star TV has started to broadcast in five channels (Mandarin channel, family entertainment channel, sports channel, MTV channel, and BBC news channel) to a large number of Asian countries. Those channels (especially Mandarin channel) are very popular in mainland China, Taiwan and Hong Kong.

Other national and commercial broadcasters have either begun regional satellite broadcasting or are actively exploring vernacular networks. For example, Televisa of Mexico offers satellite service to a large part of Spanish-speaking Latin America; France's largest broadcaster, TF-1, is actively considering a French-language channel to be launched throughout Europe, the Middle East, and Africa; at least three separate efforts are under way to develop a German-language channel for central Europe; and China is planning to establish a global Chinese channel by the year 2000. Many of these channels will either adopt a CNN model or ally themselves with CNN through news exchanges or provider-transmitter relationships.

Friedland (1992) noticed the rise of regional news organizations. He thought the world news system would eventually consist of a series of alliances and joint ventures between the global networks and regionals, and perhaps a series of consortia among the regionals themselves. As the regional vernacular broadcasters fill in the gaps in the world news system, some system of multiple alliances is almost inevitable, and what those relationships will turn out would be an interesting prospect to look forward to.

In brief, when an increasing number of countries are making more and more efforts to develop their satellite television, one major direction of those efforts seems to be making their programs internationalized as well as regionalized. They want to be internationalized because, in addition to

domestic audience and advertising money, they hope the programs will attract some international audience and then bring the companies larger commercial profits. Some global media organizations want to be more regionalized because it is easier to be accepted by a region if the programs are designed for the audience's needs and interests in that region. As Christine Leo-Mckerrow (1995) said in Mowlana's (1996) book: "Wherever we go our aim is to reach the mass audience, and the best way to do that is to reach out through their language" (p. 164).

From what has been discussed above, the most secure way to grasp the attention of the audience in a specific region is to produce programs that they think are related to them. Covering stories from the perspective of regional culture, proximity and interests is essential. Among these elements, language is the most important. In Greater China, all of these are needed for such regional vernacular news media.

The Satellite TV News Channels in Greater China

The concept of Greater China

The term "Greater China" has been frequently used in recent studies and publications. In spite of its increasing currency, it represents different views in different studies. Harding (1993) identified three dimensions by which "Greater China" is generally conceptualized. First, the term denotes the economic integration among China, Hong Kong and Taiwan. Second, it refers to the cultural exchanges among people of Chinese descent throughout

the world. Third, it means the possible re-establishment of a single Chinese state, reuniting the now politically fragmented territories.

Each of the three definitions has different boundaries, capitals or centers of activity, and takes different institutional forms. However, mainland China, Taiwan and Hong Kong are generally viewed as the three core countries or societies of the Chinese community. Therefore, this research adopts Chan's (1994) definition to regard Greater China as the economic, political, and cultural space as defined by the interactions among its three primary constituent parts--mainland China, Taiwan and Hong Kong.

Another term used to discuss the Chinese community in the literature is "Cultural China." In his (1992) study, Tu Wei-ming viewed cultural China in terms of a continuous interaction among three symbolic universes. The first consists of mainland China, Taiwan, Hong Kong, and Singapore--that is, the societies populated predominantly by ethnic and cultural Chinese. The second consists of Chinese communities all over the world, including a politically significant minority in Malaysia and a numerically negligible minority in the United States. These Chinese are often referred to as overseas Chinese, while recently they tend to define themselves as members of the Chinese "diaspora," meaning those who have settled in scattered Chinese communities far from their ancestral homeland. The third symbolic universe consists of individuals such as scholars, teachers, journalists, industrialists and writers who try to understand China intellectually and

bring their conceptions of China to their own linguistic communities (pp. 12-13).

When discussing media development in Greater China, Tu observed that the changes and development in media will inevitably have an impact on all of the three universes of cultural China.

The development of satellite TV news in Greater China

This research considers mainland China, Taiwan, and Hong Kong as three constituent parts of Greater China. Taiwan has gradually become a democracy ruled by the Kuomintang Party (KMT), which fled to Taiwan in 1949 after the defeat in a civil war with the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) and has been the political rival of the CCP. Hong Kong, leased to the British government after China lost the Opium War, was a British colony until its return to China in July 1997. Mainland China, ruled by the CCP, is a socialist country trying to modernize itself by economic reforms and an open-door policy. The television system and policy (including satellite TV) of the three societies of Greater China are just as different as their political configuration.

1. Taiwan: Television in Taiwan is controlled by the Statute for Radio and Television Broadcasting. Foreign programs usually make up less than 20% of programming under the government regulation, and programming imported from mainland China was previously subject to special regulations. However, after the government lifted all the bans on satellite reception equipments in July 1992, the sky of Taiwan has been "free," and people can

watch any satellite TV program as long as they can receive the signals (Cheng, 1995). A satellite TV station (TVBS) has established an all-news channel to provide news of Taiwan, Hong Kong, and China, as well as international news to local audience mainly in Taiwan. There is speculation that a few other media organizations have similar plans to create 24-hour news satellite TV channels.

2. Hong Kong: Television in Hong Kong operates primarily within a market structure. Although the Hong Kong governor and his Executive Council used to make decisions on the regulation and licensing of broadcasting media, the government's interference in mediated content was very minimal before Hong Kong's return to China. "Without an explicit and elaborate cultural policy, Hong Kong is virtually a free port in information as there is no strict control over the flow of media in and out of Hong Kong" (Chan, 1994, p. 4). However, although China has promised to let Hong Kong stay the way it is for at least 50 years after its return to China in 1997, it is hard to predict if the communication system and freedom in "Hong Kong Special Region" will stay the same.

A pan-Asian satellite television broadcaster (Star TV) is broadcast in English and Mandarin, but what it carries is mostly programs acquired internationally. A Mandarin-speaking 24-hour satellite TV station (CTN) has also been established to provide international information and news in one of its two channels to the audience mainly in Taiwan, as well as to a small

part of Hong Kong, a few provinces along the southeast coast of China, and other overseas Chinese communities in the United States and European countries.

3. Mainland China: China has achieved its greatest television growth since the reform years of the 1980s. About 80% of China's 1.3 billion population could receive television broadcasting in the early 1990s (Ai, 1991). Unlike Taiwan and Hong Kong, television is all state-owned and party-controlled in China. After the reforms, television stations have been allowed to broadcast programs originated from Taiwan, Hong Kong, the United States, and some other parts of the world if they get political clearance from the Ministry of Film, Radio and Television of China (Chan, 1994).

For fear of ideological influences from capitalism countries, China generally forbids all external television reception by individuals (Chan, 1992). Cable television in China is also forbidden to relay foreign satellite programs, including Taiwan and Hong Kong. However, with the relaxation of social control resulting from the sociopolitical and economic reforms, the huge size and population of China that make it very difficult to monitor the private satellite TV reception, and people getting more money and needs for information from the outside world, it is becoming more and more common for people to watch foreign satellite TV programs.

Greater China is still far from being an integrated television market. "Severe trade barriers exist between China and each of the other two Chinese

societies. Relatively free television trade exists only between Hong Kong and Taiwan which are much smaller than China in audience size" (Chan, 1994, p. 13). But limited as it is now, because of the same ethnicity, ancestral home, cultural background, and language (even Hong Kong, where Cantonese is the major dialect, is beginning to use Mandarin as official language after China's takeover), close geographical locations, intertwined societal and racial relationship (intermarriage, separated families, and national sentiments), and possible reunification of the three now separate societies (Hong Kong was returned to China on July 1st, 1997, and Taiwan and China both claim they wish a reunified China), the interactions and interdependence among the people as well as the TV industries in each of the three societies are rapidly increasing. The development of satellite TV, which conquers the limitations of terrain, distance and border, enlarges the scope of information transmission and challenges the government control over the individual reception behavior. Now it is very easy and popular to receive satellite TV programs from China in Taiwan and Hong Kong, and it is not very hard to watch Hong Kong's and Taiwan's satellite TV programs in mainland China either. These factors provide reliable reasons and predictions as to why there are more and more media organizations entering the trend of vernacular satellite TV new channels aimed at appealing to all Chinese, and why they think they have a market.

In light of the literature reviewed above, the rise of vernacular (Mandarin-speaking) satellite TV news channels in Greater China can be viewed as an example of sub-regional communication in the context of global communication. This is a new trend, and there is almost no study or even data directly related to this subject. Whether those news channels want to or have the ability to become international news alternatives, or whether they can bring about a Chinese cultural integration--framing a Greater China identity and consciousness--are noteworthy issues.

Based on this review of literature, this study attempted to explore the following general research questions:

1. Do these satellite TV news channels in Greater China intend to provide international news through the perspective of Chinese people to the rest of the world? Or do they just want to provide Chinese people with more international news?

2. Do these satellite TV news channels in Greater China intend to frame a Greater China or cultural China image in their news through a pan-Chinese perspective?

Deriving from the general questions, two major hypotheses were developed to test the results of the framing analysis part:

H1: These satellite TV news channels will focus more on the pan-Chinese frame than local TV news when they cover international news (because local TV stations just edit international news that is from

mainstream news media).

H2: These satellite TV news channels will focus more on the pan-Chinese frames when they cover local news events, while traditional local TV news will more local-oriented frames.

In terms of the content types, three hypotheses were established to examine the comparisons of these satellite TV news and local TV news:

H3: Satellite TV news channels will include more international news stories on their TV news programs.

H4: Satellite TV news channels will provide more news from other Chinese societies than the local TV stations separately (for example, CTN covers more news from China and Hong Kong than Taiwan television station does).

H5: Satellite TV news channels will have more international stories that are covered by their own correspondents than local TV stations.

Framing Analysis

To answer the above general questions, this study used content analysis to examine the news content of these news channels. Because one of the purposes of this study was to explore the perspectives these organizations use in their news stories, framing analysis was an appropriate method for this research.

The concept of framing

The concept of framing was defined by Bateon (1972) as a metacommunication about how one should interpret what is said and done in an episode. Gamson (1989) viewed framing as "a central organizing idea for making sense of relevant events and suggesting what is at issue" (p.33). Frames can give meanings to details about news stories by "arranging them in a coherent way to emphasize particular facts; they can also de-emphasize or neglect other stories," framing, in a sense, "acts as a sorter" (Woolcock, 1997, p. 11).

What is used within the frame is essentially separated from what is unusable. Gamson (1989) noted that the issue is suggested and certain facts are divulged about the issue, while other facts are omitted. The same point was made by Pearce (1994), who suggested that the imposition of a frame stipulates what is included is set off from the outside, while what is inside excludes the outside and derives its meaning from the frame itself.

Framing suggests subjectivity in many studies. Graber (1989) observed news content and concluded that journalists create their audience's reality by framing content, which is then interpreted and judged within a certain context. Iyengar (1991) also questioned the objectivity of news framing. He maintained that the public gets a distorted view of political responsibility.

Framing research

Numerous researchers have used the concept to discuss news coverage. Framing is supposed to be useful to researchers as a means of "referring to how an event is portrayed in a particular news story" (Tankard, 1991, p. 1). Mass communication studies need a method to explore not just what events are reported in the news--the goal of many quantitative content analysis research studies--but how the events are reported. Pan and Kosicki (1993) also agreed that news is constructed carefully and should be examined by framing analysis so that evidence of the news media's framing of issues in news stories may be gathered.

Therefore, how media present information will influence the audience's reaction to the information, which means, how an event is portrayed affects how it is perceived. An early study best explained this idea. Cutbirth, Craig et al. (1980) noted that one group of observers who watched the MacArthur parade in Chicago during the Korean War in person perceived the parade differently from the group watched the parade on TV.

In a study of the effects of framing, Davis (1995) also examined how the framing of environmental communication influenced attitudes and environmentally responsible behaviors. He concluded that framing can significantly influence how an issue is perceived and how alternative decisions are evaluated.

In brief, many studies supported the idea that the press frames the issues, and how a news story is framed will influence the audience's perceptions of this news story and will play an important role in shaping the consciousness of a society.

Chapter III

Methodology

Many regional news alternatives have appeared in a bid to change the apparent imbalance and unfairness in the international information flow. However, most of them have gained little progress in altering the news flow because of the lack of staff, capital, and market. As a result, some organizations have shifted their target audience to residents in a specific region where people share similar language, geographic location, and cultural background so that they can have a focused audience market, and it is easier for them to produce news catering to their target audience's interests and needs.

This research is based on two assumptions. First, the main purposes of those news organizations in Greater China are to gather and transmit international news from the angle of Chinese people, and to provide news regarding Chinese societies from the pan-Chinese perception to the world. Second, those news organizations also wish to serve as a communication bridge for all Chinese people (mainly people in China, Taiwan, and Hong Kong) and to provide news about Greater China (a Chinese community consists of mainland China, Taiwan, and Hong Kong) framed through a pan-Chinese news perspective. In order to get more complete answers to the research questions, some qualitative methods as well as quantitative methods

were adopted: in-depth interviews, observations, content analysis and framing analysis.

Qualitative method

For more focused and detailed research, this study picked one satellite TV news organization, the 24-hour news channel of Chinese Television Network (CTN) headquartered in Hong Kong. The researcher went to the news center of the company in Taiwan to conduct observations and in-depth interviews with the general manager, journalists and other employees in June, 1997. The questions included:

1. Why did they established this kind of 24-hours international news satellite TV channel?
2. What was their target audience?
3. Why did they only use Mandarin?
4. What kind of news did they provide and why?
5. What kind of difficulties did they encounter?
6. What targets did they want to achieve?
7. What kind of influences and functions did they think they have?
8. Who were their main commercial supporters?
9. Whether had their commercial resources become broader because of the broader target audience they intended to have?
10. What is their future target and what kind of adjustments do they intend to make?

The observations focused on their company structure, operation, news treatment, reporting and editing concerns, and influential factors in the news production process, etc.

The interviewees included: general manager, news department director, one news anchor, and two reporters.

Quantitative method

In addition to the perceptions on the part of the media staff, this study also adopted content analysis to analyze the news content of this organization to compare with its self-perceptions and to examine the influences and functions from the news itself. Moreover, if there is no comparison, it is difficult to tell whether the news frames the sub-regional (or regional) satellite news channel adopts are different from those adopted by national and local news channels; therefore, this study also picked two national channels in Greater China (Taiwan Television in Taiwan and Central Television in China) to conduct the same content analysis as a comparison.

To examine the expressed discourse on these channels, the content of their news was analyzed through two techniques. First, a traditional content analysis was designed to examine what content was in the news reports. Based on previous studies of the Chinese press (see for example, Chang, Wang & Chen, 1994; He, 1996), several basic subject categories were developed: construction, politics/government, economy, international relations, foreign news, relations of the three places of both sides of the

Taiwan Strait, science/ technology/ education/ arts/ culture, ceremony/ activity, social issues/ livelihood, sports, disaster/ accident, crime/ law, environment/ weather, military, corruption, media, model/ hero, human interests, etc. The researcher also categorized news stories in terms of their resources: reporters, wire service subscription and monitored stories.

Second, the more important purpose of this research was to investigate how news events were covered in terms of the two assumptions of this research, so a framing analysis was also employed. Unlike the traditional classification of tones of news stories, the framing analysis is supposed to be more useful and sensitive to detect the perspectives of news stories, which is the "persistent patterns of cognition, interpretation, and presentation, of selection, emphasis and exclusion, by which symbol-handlers routinely organize discourse" (Gitlin, 1980, p. 27).

The researcher compared news from CTN with that from the two local TV stations separately to examine the above two hypotheses.

Sample

For the content and framing analysis of this research, a purposive sample was recorded from the evening news programs of the three channels (TTV, CCTV, and CTN). The time period was from June 9, 1997 through June 15, 1997, and the length of TTV evening news program was one hour, CTN was also one hour, and CCTV was 35 minutes. A total of 544 stories were

categorized and examined for frames (214 stories from TTV, 172 stories from CCTV, and 158 stories from CTN).

Frames

Frames in this research were defined in accordance with the method developed by Tankard et al. (1991). They identified frames by looking at certain focal points of news presentations. In this study, which includes leads, selection of quotes, selection of sources, pictures (statistics, charts and graphs were included), statements, and conclusions of news stories.

For this research, the stories were analyzed by the eight frames: legitimate government/ system, ideological moderatism, us, them, localism, pan-Chinese, audience recognition, and narrator. They are defined as follows:

Legitimate Government/ System

A legitimate government/ system frame is defined as one that focuses on the recognition of the government, of the ideology the government adopts, or of the political system the country runs. For example, a story from TTV was coded as using this frame because it used "Republic of China" to represent Taiwan, and "Chinese Communist Party" to represent China; a story from CCTV was coded as using this frame because it used "the great Socialism" in its report.

Ideological Moderatism

An ideological moderatism frame is defined as one which focuses on the objective evaluation of any government system, or on the vagueness or

omission of the ideology a story supports. For example, a story from CTN was coded as using this frame because it used "mainland China," "Hong Kong," and "Taiwan" to represent the three places of both sides of the Taiwan Strait without favoring or emphasizing any side.

Us

This frame is defined by the usage of such words as "our country, our government, our party, the other side, both sides." For example, a story from TTV was coded as using "us" frame for saying "our national military"; and a story from CCTV was considered using this frame for saying "our homeland" to refer to mainland China.

Them

This frame is defined by the usage of the angle of outsiders. There is no "our" side or "their" side, and the only side the reporter takes is the side of a fair and distant third party. The reporter does not identify his or her position in a story.

Localism

A localism frame is defined as a frame that views a story from the point of view of a certain country or area. It only represents the viewpoint of one place or one side, or it just covers partial aspects of a story. For example, a story from CCTV was assigned a localism frame because it only concerned the people in mainland China; and a story from TTV was also assigned this frame because it only talked about the local flood and the loss of local people.

Pan-Chinese Perspective

Pan-Chinese perspective is defined as a frame that considers the interests or stands of all Chinese people (people in mainland China, Hong Kong, and Taiwan especially). For example, a story from CTN was viewed as using a pan-Chinese perspective frame because it talked about the different influences a policy might cause to the three places of both sides of the Taiwan Strait.

Audience Recognition

This is a frame that focuses on the benefits of audience, or on reminding audience that the reporter and the news organization are on the same side as the audience. National or local media often use this frame to show that they are someone the audience can count on; and to reduce the distance between the media and their audience. Reporters who use this frame often view themselves as their audience's mouthpiece. Stories that try to tell the audience that they are taken care of or what they should do to prevent bad things also adopt this frame. For example, a story from TTV was coded as using this frame because it used sentences such as "residents must be careful of..." and "you should know...".

Narrator

This frame is defined as one that doesn't appeal to certain local audience or doesn't clearly identify who its target audience is. Stories that

adopt this frame will not directly talk to the audience, nor will they try to tell their audience what to do.

Units of Analysis and Measurement

The unit of analysis for this research was each story on the three different TV channels.

This study had five hypotheses. In terms of framing analysis, two hypotheses were tested.

H1. CTN would focus more on such frames as ideological moderatism, them, pan-Chinese perspective, and narrator than TTV and CCTV.

H2. TTV and CCTV would focus more on such frames as legitimate government/ system, us, localism, and audience recognition than CTN.

Chi-square test was used to analyze the data and to test the above hypotheses.

In terms of content analysis, three hypotheses were examined.

H3. CTN would include more international news stories in its evening news program than CCTV and TTV.

H4. CTN would provide more news from other Chinese societies than CCTV and TTV.

H5. CTN would have more international stories covered by their own correspondents than CCTV and TTV.

In identifying the frames, a pre-test was conducted. A sample of one-hour news program was recorded and 20 stories from it were selected to identify the frames that were used to analyze the news content according to the hypotheses in this research. The pre-test also included the intercoder reliability test.

Intercoder reliability

To establish the intercoder reliability, "which refers to the percentage of agreement among coders" (Woolcock, 1997, p.33), a test of measuring frames was included in the pre-test. The researcher (female) and one assistant (male) selected and coded a sample of 20 news stories, and those stories were not used in the study.

Both of the coders were given a video copy of the news stories and a coding sheet with the framing mechanisms (See Appendix A). The percentage of intercoder reliability coefficient, established for this study, was .925. This agreement for the pilot test was found by averaging the percentages of agreement for the frames the 20 stories adopted. For the formula and figures, see Appendix B.

Chapter V

Results

This chapter presents the results of the content and framing analyses and indepth interviews. The results indicate that the content of three television stations examined in the sample week was quite different and supported almost all the hypotheses.

Framing Analysis

The first hypothesis (H1) predicted that the CTN evening news would focus more on such frames as "ideological moderatism," "them," "Pan-Chinese," and "narrator" than TTV and CCTV. The second hypothesis (H2) predicted that TTV and CCTV would focus more on the "legitimate government or system," "us," "localism," and "audience recognition" frames than CTN. Both hypotheses were supported by the data (See Table 1 and Table 2).

Of the 158 news items of the CTN evening news, 140 items (89%) used the "ideological moderatism" frame, and only 18 items (all of them were covered by CTN's reporters in Taiwan) showed confirmation of the local government or support of the ideology the government adopts. Of the 214 TTV evening news items, 165 items used the "ideological moderatism" frame (77%), while on the CCTV evening news, more news stories (52%) used the frame of legitimate government or system (89 out of 172 items).

As the chi square (a) in Table 2 shows, there was a statistically significant difference between CTN and CCTV at $p < .001$, which means CTN did adopt more of the "ideological moderatism" frame than CCTV. However, the chi square (b) shows that there was not a statistically significant difference between CTN and TTV if using the same probability level. A significant difference was found only at the probability level of $p < .01$.

Of the CTN evening news, 145 items adopted the "them" frame (92%), but only 13 items (all of them were covered by Taiwan reporters) identified that the reporter was part of the locality and used the "us" frame. TTV also used the "them" frame more often: 159 items in this frame (74%). Again, CCTV differed from TTV and CTN as 111 items used the "us" frame as reflected by such terms as "my/our country, my/our military, my/our side...". Although CTN and TTV used more "them" frame, and CCTV used more "us" frame, the chi square results (c) and (d) show that there was a statistically significant difference between CTN and CCTV as well as between CTN and TTV at $p < .001$. This means that CTN had more stories using the "them" frame than both CCTV and TTV.

In terms of the "localism" and the "pan-Chinese" frames, all of the three channels used the "localism" frame more than the "pan-Chinese" frame. TTV and CCTV covered all of their stories using the "localism" frame. Even CTN had as many as 92% of all news stories covered simply from the local viewpoint, although a few reporters tried to analyze events through

different angles in terms of the three places in Greater China. Because no story in the news programs of the TTV and CCTV used the "pan-Chinese" frame, the chi square was not calculated.

TTV, CCTV, and CTN all had higher percentages of news items using the "narrator" frame. One hundred and fifty items on the CTN evening news used the "narrator" frame, accounting for 95% of all stories, and 79% of TTV evening news and 67% of CCTV evening news used the same frame. However, 21% of the TTV evening news tried to "remind, petition, or warn" its audience, and 33% of the CCTV evening news pointed out clearly that the members of the Chinese society were taken care of by the government or reminded its audience members of who they were--citizens of the People's Republic of China. In contrast, only 5% of the CTN evening news did that (see Table 1). The chi-square analysis in Table 1 shows that there was a statistically significant difference between CTN and CCTV as well as between CTN and TTV.

The chi squares (c), (d), (e) and (f) all show there were statistically significant differences between CTN and TTV as well as between CTN and CCTV at $p < .001$. This means that CTN adopted significantly more of the "them," "pan-Chinese," and "narrator" frames than TTV and CCTV, whereas CCTV and TTV adopted more of the "us," "localism," and "audience recognition" than CTN (See Table 2).

Content Analysis

1. TTV: Coverage of disaster/ accident made up the largest slice of the TTV evening news, accounting for 19% of the total 214 stories. This overwhelming devotion to such events was mostly due to the continuous heavy rain and the serious damages caused by it in the Taiwan area during the sample period. Other major categories were crime/law (17%); politics/government (16%); social issues/livelihood (9%); foreign news (8%); economy (6%); and sports (6%). However, the percentage was calculated in terms of items, not length or display, which made crime/law and foreign news categories possess higher percentage than they really did because most stories in those two categories were much shorter than stories of other categories. TTV's coverage of events in Hong Kong comprised 4% (most stories were about Hong Kong's return to China), coverage of events in mainland China only made up 1% (one item), and not one story was about overseas Chinese (See Table 3).

2. CCTV: Politics/government news played the most important role on the CCTV evening news, accounting for 22% of the total 172 news items. Those stories were almost all about the activities and speeches of government leaders. Other major types of news stories included foreign news (20%); international relations (10%); science/technology/education/arts/culture (9%); construction (8%); and Hong Kong events (8%). Again, when the display and length of stories were examined, foreign news stories were not as

prominent as they appeared to be because they were much shorter than stories of all other types, and they were always placed in the last part of the news program. The international relations category mostly consisted of stories covering China leaders' meetings with representatives from foreign countries or China leaders' visits to foreign countries. There was no coverage of events in Taiwan or of "bad things of any kind" in mainland China (See Table 3).

3. CTN: Because CTN is not a local news service like TTV and CCTV, the division of national news and foreign news did not exist because its target audience was not limited to the people of one "nation." It emphasized more the three places of both sides of the Taiwan Strait. To analyze its content, the stories were divided into six areas (Taiwan, Hong Kong, mainland China, Greater China, overseas Chinese communities, and international societies) and then further divided into the same categories as the evening news programs of TTV and CCTV. CTN's evening news program usually began with international news that included events in the United States, Hong Kong, mainland China, and other countries except Taiwan. Then it reported news of the stock markets in Asia and in Greater China, followed by some simple business information related to Asia. Finally it devoted about one third of the evening news time to "news from Taiwan." Naturally, events in Taiwan comprised the largest part, accounting for 42% of the 158 items, followed by international news (26%); events in Hong Kong (16%); events

involving the three parts in Greater China (9%); events in mainland China (6%); and events about overseas Chinese communities (1%). In Taiwan news, most stories were devoted to politics (36% of the total 66 items of Taiwan news), disaster/ accident, crime/law, and economy. The allocation and composition of news was similar to that of TTV news. In Hong Kong news, international relations comprised the largest part (40% of the total 25 items of Hong Kong news), then politics, social issues, and ceremonies. In China news, stories about international relations was prominent (50% of the total 10 items of China news), followed by politics. The content and allocation of news was quite different from that of CCTV evening news (See Table 4).

According to the above results of content analysis, H3 and H4 were supported because CTN included more international (foreign) news than TTV and CCTV (CTN: 26%; TTV: 8%; and CCTV: 20%); and CTN also provided more news stories from other Chinese societies than TTV and CCTV. TTV had only 1% of its news about China, 4% about Hong Kong, 3% about the interaction between the three places in Greater China, and none about overseas Chinese communities. CCTV devoted nothing to Taiwan, 8% to Hong Kong, 1% to the interactions between the three places in Greater China, and none to overseas Chinese communities. In contrast CTN devoted most of its news to mainland China, Taiwan and Hong Kong, 9% to the interaction between the three places of Greater China, and 1% to overseas Chinese communities.

It was found that the news sources of the three evening news programs were very similar. TTV, CCTV, and CTN all got their news mostly from their own reporters (84% of the total 214 stories of TTV evening news, 73% of the total 172 stories of CCTV evening news, and 65% of the total 158 stories of CTN evening news). Almost all of the foreign or international news stories of the three channels were translated versions from mainstream international news organizations (such as CNN, NHK, and BBC). CTN got 32% of its evening news from the major international wire services and almost all its international news from other news agencies (See Table 5). Therefore, H5 was not supported because CTN had even fewer international stories covered by its own correspondents than CCTV and TTV (35% of CTN evening news was not covered by its own reporters or correspondents, while 27% of CCTV evening news and 16% of TTV evening news was not covered by their own journalists).

In-depth Interviews

Although the above content and framing analysis was helpful in examining and analyzing the expressed discourse of the new satellite TV news channel (CTN), it provided only part of the information about how the news was produced the way it was. To understand more of the news production process, a series of observations and interviews was conducted during the sample period.

The observations and interviews took place in the Taipei news center of CTN because it is the biggest and most important center of CTN. Although CTN's headquarters is in Hong Kong, decisions about policies and news arrangements are often made in Taipei because the major audience and market are there. Several people were interviewed for this research: Shi Shen-lin, president of Taipei news center; Cheng Hou, ex-president of Taipei news center; Wu Ann-wein, news director and anchor; Jun Jia-ping, reporter; Jen Wei-cheng, reporter.

The Goals

Both the ex-president and the president of CTN Taipei news center said CTN was a dream, an experiment, and a harbinger. When CTN was established in late 1994, it created the slogan of "establishing the Chinese version of CNN" in the hope that it could become the representative of all Chinese people on the stage of international news. "CNN created a whole new domain for international communication, and there's no reason why Chinese can't," said Shi Shen-lin. Establishing a news channel that geared toward all Chinese in the world was something nobody ever dared to do and nobody ever believed would be a success.

In Wu Ann-wein's eyes, the slogan of creating a Chinese CNN was an abstract idea. They used it just because they wanted to show that CTN was not a local channel. They asked themselves what Chinese people care about, and where these Chinese people are because "we want to provide all Chinese with

international views," said Wu Ann-wein. It was very clear that CTN's final target audience was all Chinese throughout the world, although the people at CTN knew it would take time to achieve the ideal. That was part of the reason why at first they focused on the markets of the three places on both sides of the Taiwan Strait--mainland China, Taiwan, and Hong Kong.

The other reason was that the three places have the majority of the Chinese population, and they are the center of so-called Greater China. Because Mandarin is the most commonly used language among Chinese, it was agreed without controversy that the new station would broadcast in Mandarin to create a Mandarin-speaking vernacular satellite TV news channel.

"CTN had great expectations for the communication between both sides of the Taiwan Strait," said Cheng Hou. It thought the two sides would have more interchange and deeper interdependency. In 1997, Hong Kong would return to mainland China, and, consequently, Chinese people in the three different places would become more aware of the entanglement of their fate. Chen said if the opportunity came, CTN would become the most important Chinese medium; if not, it would be eliminated by the two sides.

The Operation

"It is not easy to elevate oneself to look at things," said Wu. If a reporter from a local station used the term "our side," the audience would know it means Taiwan, Hong Kong, or mainland China, depending on which

of the three parts the reporter represented. CTN's reporters could not use terms like that. Wu emphasized that they had to separate themselves from the locality and narrate things from the viewpoint of a third party. It was important to keep an appropriate distance from the news events and from the audience. To do that, they always had to remember to elevate their position to a higher and more neutral level.

"We are told to identify where the event is located," said Jun Jia-ping, "We need to remember that we are talking to the audience situated in different places. We can't let them feel we are on a certain side." Jen Wei-chen said she would add "Taiwan" in certain parts of a story when reporters from local media did not have to.

"Our audience target was supposed to be all Chinese people; therefore, we decided to use captions from the beginning in case some Chinese don't understand Mandarin," said Shi. The new channel also decided to adopt the translation standards of the United Nation because the translated names of people and countries are different in the three different places of Greater China. The ideologies the three places adopt and the explanations of politics and of history the three places acknowledge are very different. For example, people in Taiwan call October 10th "the National Day" of China, while people in mainland China think October 1st is the National Day of China. "Many times, we pleased nobody even when we achieved a compromise."

The Difficulty

A compromise to the people at CTN did not mean a compromise to both sides of the Taiwan Strait--Taiwan and mainland China. More and more problems started to emerge on their way to establishing a news medium for all Chinese. "Our own journalists were arguing all the time," Shi said. There were too many political taboos between the two sides, and people were cut off from each other for too long. "I found out there is no such thing as a pan-Chinese perspective," Shi said.

There are Chinese in Taiwan, Chinese in mainland China, Chinese in Hong Kong, and Chinese in other countries. "They are from different places, and they have totally different stands, ideologies, and political views. They are not the same Chinese," Shi said. His view was shared by Chen, who said CTN had entered Singapore, and Singaporean people didn't want to watch so many stories about Taiwan, while Taiwan people thought CTN provided too little Taiwan news. This kind of reaction made CTN start to think that Chinese probably did not care much about Chinese in other places and "CTN could not suppose Chinese would be reunified under its news."

Another big difficulty CTN faced was the limited market. China did not allow CTN to enter its cable market, and Hong Kong had reception barriers. Now only a small part of Hong Kong, a few provinces along the southeast coast of China, a big part of Taiwan and of Singapore, some places in Japan, and a few cities in Europe and in the United States could receive its

signals, which made Taiwan its only market that could have profit potential. It was even harder to promote a pan-Chinese perspective when the actual audience was so limited and concentrated.

Because the major audience was in Taiwan, CTN's revenue came mostly from commercial business in Taiwan. "The clients often ask us to provide more local news to attract more local audience. It's hard to refuse them when you can only get money from them and nothing from other places where you cover and provide news," Wu said. This situation also devastated CTN's ideal that its commercial resources would become broader than local media because of the broader target audience it intended to have.

CTN is the first news organization that aimed at providing news through a pan-Chinese viewpoint. It faced the severe pressure of competition with local media. However, its rating was far behind some major local TV news organizations. "It takes time to teach audience to accept the way we treat news and to look at local things through a higher scope," Wu said. Actually, the people at CTN foresaw the adjustment time people need. They knew it would take a long time, if ever, to establish CTN among the audience. But CTN was losing money at a rate faster than their imagination, Chen said. The lack of budget made it very difficult to improve or even keep staff. Jun said he started to do TV production work instead of being a photo journalist, and Jen said she was new in the company and the reporters there changed a lot. The ownership was taken over by a big consortium in Taiwan in mid

1997 because of CTN's financial crisis. It was hard to predict whether the policy and target would be changed in the future.

The Achievement

Although CTN faced many challenges and problems, it explored the potentials of Chinese media on the international communication stage. "Our ideal is realized successfully in the overseas Chinese community," Shi said. According to CTN's data, it was the most watched Chinese-language TV news program in Northern America, and it was quite popular in the Chinese community of Australia, New Zealand, Fiji, and Japan. Although those Chinese communities include people from mainland China, Taiwan, Hong Kong, and other places, it seemed that they were more likely to care about other Chinese and to accept CTN's news treatment, said Shi and Wu.

The recognition of mainstream international news media and other countries was another encouraging sign to CTN. Because of "the lack of nationality," many news organizations viewed CTN as a news medium that represented Chinese people rather than a medium from Taiwan, Hong Kong, or mainland China. The exclusive news of Deng Xiaoping's death also helped CTN win more popularity on the international stage because many mainstream international news organizations used its story or quoted its coverage, Shi said.

Future

"We have already done some exploration in the direction of creating a news channel for all Chinese," Shi said. "We still view ourselves as an international news organization. We want to be the bridge of Chinese people to other Chinese people and to the world."

Some people shared similar opinions. Although they knew they were very far from their goals, they still thought the direction only needed to be adjusted, not changed. "We tried to extend the scope of news and to analyze the same issue from different angles. We did something that hasn't been done before," said Wu.

The first thing CTN planned to do was to consolidate the Taiwan market because it was CTN's major, if not only, market. "We plan to produce different versions of news according to different needs of different markets," Shi said. First, it would probably produce a Taiwan version and an international version. In the Taiwan version, it would provide more local news and still a certain amount of international news that was covered by its different news centers and branches throughout the world. He hoped this approach could satisfy the need of the local audience more without completely abandoning the ideal of a pan-Chinese perspective.

"I suggested this approach before I left," said Chen, who switched to TVBS--another satellite TV station in Taiwan. TVBS adopted a totally

different way to run its 24-hour news channel. It provided news for the Taiwan audience only, and covered all news from the perspective and interests of Taiwan people. "At CTN, it reports news as it is; at TVBS, it covers news in terms of what its audience cares." Chen Hou said the strategy TVBS adopted was successful, and CTN should change its strategy to learn the same idea of repackaging news from TVBS if it wants profits. CTN tried to include every perspective. "It's all-inclusive and tolerated," Chen said. He thought the real challenge was how to promote the whole thing to different places separately while keeping CTN's main ideal--providing a pan-Chinese perspective to all Chinese and to the world.

Table 1.
Frames of TTV, CCTV, and CTN Evening News Stories in A Sample Week of 1997.

Frame	TTV n= 214	CCTV n= 172	CTN n= 158
Legitimate Government/ System	49 (23%)	89 (52%)	18 (11%)
Ideological Moderatism	165 (77%)	83 (48%)	140 (89%)
Us	55 (26%)	111 (65%)	13 (8%)
Them	159 (74%)	61 (36%)	145 (92%)
Localism	214 (100%)	172 (100%)	146 (92%)
Pan-Chinese	0	0	12 (8%)
Audience Recognition	45 (21%)	57 (33%)	8 (5%)
Narrator	169 (79%)	115 (67%)	150 (95%)
Total	214 (100%)	172 (100%)	158 (100%)

Table 2.
The Chi-Square Analysis of CTN, TTV, and CCTV Evening News Frames.

(a).	CTN n= 158	CCTV n= 172	(b).	CTN n= 158	TTV n= 214
Frame 1	140 (89%)	83 (48%)	Frame 1	140 (89%)	165 (77%)
Frame 2	18 (11%)	89 (52%)	Frame 2	18 (11%)	49 (23%)
$X^2 (1, N= 330) = 61.19, p < .001$			$X^2 (1, N= 372) = 8.14, p < .01$		
(c).	CTN	CCTV	(d).	CTN	TTV
Frame 3	145 (92%)	61 (35%)	Frame 3	145 (92%)	159 (74%)
Frame 4	13 (8%)	111 (65%)	Frame 4	13 (8%)	55 (26%)
$X^2 (1, N= 330) = 111.32, p < .001$			$X^2 (1, N= 372) = 18.57, p < .001$		
(e).	CTN	CCTV	(f).	CTN	TTV
Frame 5	150 (95%)	115 (67%)	Frame 5	150 (95%)	169 (79%)
Frame 6	8 (5%)	57 (33%)	Frame 6	8 (5%)	45 (21%)
$X^2 (1, N= 330) = 41.04, p < .001$			$X^2 (1, N= 372) = 18.96, p < .001$		
Frame 1= Ideological Moderatism			Frame2=Legitimate Government/ System		
Frame 3= Them			Frame 4= Us		
Frame 5= Narrator			Frame 6= Audience Recognition		

Table 3. Subjects of TTV and CCTV Evening News Stories in A Sample Week.

	TTV n= 214	CCTV n= 172
Construction	1 (1%)	14 (8%)
Politics/ Government	35 (16%)	37 (22%)
Economy	13 (6%)	10 (6%)
International Relations	5 (2%)	17 (10%)
Foreign News	17 (8%)	35 (20%)
Science/Technology/Education/ Arts/Culture	2 (1%)	15 (9%)
Ceremony/ Activity	0	6 (4%)
Social Issue/ Livelihood	19 (9%)	6 (4%)
Sports	13 (6%)	0
Disaster/ Accident	41 (19%)	0
Media	2 (1%)	2 (1%)
Human Interest	7 (3%)	0
Crime/Law	37 (17%)	2 (1%)
Military	3 (1%)	1 (1%)
Corruption	0	1 (1%)
Environment/ Weather	4 (2%)	2 (1%)
Model/ Hero	0	10 (6%)
Events in China	1 (1%)	(Taiwan) 0
Events in Hong Kong	8 (4%)	13 (7%)
The Three Places of Both Sides	6 (3%)	1 (1%)
Total	214 (100%)	172 (100%)

Table 4.
Areas and Subjects of CTN Evening News Stories in A Sample Week in 1997.

Area Subject	Taiwan	Hong Kong	Mainland China	The Three Places	International Societies	Overseas Chinese
Politics	24 (36%)	6 (24%)	2 (20%)			
Economy	8 (12%)	0	0			
International Relations	2 (3%)	10 (40%)	5 (50%)			
Science/ Technology/ Arts/culture	6 (9%)	1 (4%)	1 (10%)			
Ceremony/ Activity	0	2 (8%)	0			
Social Issue/ Livelihood	6 (9%)	4 (16%)	1 (10%)			
Sports	1 (2%)	0	0			
Disaster/ Accident	8 (12%)	0	1 (10%)			
Human Interest	0	1 (4%)	0			
Crime/Law	8 (12%)	1 (4%)	0			
Military	3 (5%)	0	0			
Total	66 (42%)	25 (16%)	10 (6%)	15 (9%)	41 (26%)	1 (1%)

Table 5.
Sources of TTV, CCTV, and CTN Evening News Stories.

Source	TTV n= 214	CCTV n= 172	CTN n= 158
Reporter	180 (84%)	126 (73%)	102 (65%)
Wire Subscription	35 (15%)	38 (22%)	51 (32%)
Monitored Material	1 (1%)	8 (5%)	5 (3%)
Total	214 (100%)	172 (100%)	158 (100%)

Chapter V

Discussion

This study has analyzed a case in the trend of establishing regional and sub-regional news organizations. The data suggest that the case of CTN was not successful. This new satellite TV news channel tried to frame a picture of Greater China and tried to adopt a pan-Chinese perspective. However, the presentation of its news did not completely match its goals, nor was it totally in accord with what the people at CTN said they were doing.

A Bridge to All Chinese?

The goal of CTN was to become a 24-hour satellite TV news channel for all Chinese. The channel wanted to reflect the viewpoints of all Chinese in the world--a pan-Chinese perspective--and to cover events in all Chinese communities. From the results of the content analysis, it was found that CTN covered many more stories about Taiwan than about the other two places of "the three places of both sides of the Taiwan Strait." The lack of information about mainland China was especially obvious although it was because of the news censorship in China and limited access to information.

There is a large number of Chinese in "foreign countries" outside the three places of the two sides. Millions of overseas Chinese live in the United States, European countries, Japan, and other Asian countries. This study found that TTV and CCTV did not cover any story about overseas Chinese communities and even CTN had only one report related to overseas Chinese.

In the picture of Greater China CTN framed in its news, Taiwan occupied the biggest part, followed by Hong Kong, China and other Chinese communities. In the pan-Chinese perspective CTN reflected in its evening news program, Taiwan people had a much greater voice than people in any other Chinese societies. The specific gravity of CTN news was unbalanced in proportion of the number of Chinese people in those Chinese communities.

From the observations and interviews, it was also found that journalists only added the name of the place where they covered stories or used neutral terms when they covered sensitive issues regarding the different ideologies and systems of the two sides to show that they were using the so-called pan-Chinese perspective, a fancy term that has little meaning to it.

On the other hand, the hypotheses of the framing analysis of this study were mostly supported. The way CTN handled news was different from Taiwanese and Chinese local or national media in some aspects. As Wu said, he always reminded himself and other journalists of elevating their positions and keeping an appropriate distance from news events. But these principles are general ones for any objective coverage, not just for international news organizations. In the relatively free society of Taiwan, journalists also try to be a third party as long as things do not involve the interests of their government and people. Therefore, CTN had only slightly higher percentage of news adopting neutral and objective frames (CTN did not significantly differ from TTV in terms of using "ideological moderatism" frame), and it

made a little more effort to analyze stories from the angles of Chinese in different societies.

A Bridge to the World?

To be an international news channel for all Chinese, another objective of CTN was to provide Chinese people with updated and complete international information through the Chinese perspective. The findings of the content analysis showed that CTN got almost all its international stories from its subscription to the major world wire services, and its international news was a translated version of news covered by mainstream international news organizations. It was found through field observations that CTN did not organize and present those translated stories through a different "Chinese perspective." The translators simply translated what the wire news said. Therefore, there was no big difference between the way local media handled foreign news and the way CTN handled international news, except for the fact that CTN included more international news stories and translated more international news items. It was hard to recognize how CTN reported international news through the perspective of Chinese people.

On the other hand, CTN also intended to provide international societies with news about Chinese people from the Chinese perspective. The content analysis did not examine this part, but the interviews and observations found that CTN sometimes served as a major source of information on Greater China for many international journalists and some

government officials, and many international media used the story of the death of Deng Xiaoping from CTN. However, CTN's visibility was still limited in the international news arena.

A Chinese Version of CNN?

Although many of the interviewees emphasized that "a Chinese version of CNN" was just a promotional slogan and CTN did not intend to become one, the goal of becoming a news channel for all Chinese people and the self-recognition of an international news organization were mentioned over and over again. From the different content and framing analyses, in-depth interviews, and field observations, it can be said that, measured by its goals, the development of CTN was just an experiment in Chinese societies, and it was not a success yet.

Several factors may help to explain the struggle of CTN. First, CTN wanted to become a news channel for all Chinese people, but only a small part of the Chinese communities throughout the world could receive its broadcasting. The censorship in China made it really hard to cover events in mainland China, and it also prohibited all satellite news broadcasting from outside the country. It was very difficult to develop a channel for all Chinese while most Chinese were invisible and a huge market was closed.

Second, there were too many differences between the two biggest Chinese societies--mainland China and Taiwan. People on both sides of the Taiwan Strait have been separated from each other for more than 40 years,

and the two governments have adopted different ideologies and political systems. They used to be enemies, and there is still hostility between them. At the same time, people in other Chinese societies also differ from one another. It was really hard to find the same interests they shared and the same issues they all cared about enough to attract their attention without causing any dispute.

Third, unlike some successful examples of international news organizations, CTN did not have a home base to depend on. CNN is a news channel of the United States, BBC is a broadcasting company in Great Britain, and NHK is based in Japan. They all have a huge home base and market to support their existence and extension, and they all have national interests to protect, which make them more easily accepted by their national audience. CTN did not have a national base, only a vague market.

Fourth, the lack of financial resources meant CTN could not afford to pay an adequate number of journalists to achieve its goals. It was difficult to compete with local news media when an international news organization did not have more correspondents than local media to cover international news. It was more difficult to compete on local events when it had fewer journalists than the local media.

Although there have been so many obstacles, the needs for such a satellite news channel as CTN are still there: the possible reunification of the three places in Greater China, the increasing opportunities of communication

and contact of Taiwan and mainland China, and the potential market of mainland China. CTN did not fully develop the specialties it alleged it would have. Only when it hires enough journalists, covers more international and local stories in a more timely fashion than local media, presents events through different angles, and develops a mature and meaningful pan-Chinese perspective as it planned to, can it be possible to test the need for and feasibility of a news channel for all Chinese in the world.

Limitations of This Research

This study has tried to explore the new trend of regional or sub-regional news organizations and the possibilities of the realization of such organizations in Greater China by examining the case of CTN. Many issues that were not adequately examined by the literature have been examined and discussed in this study. However, the study has suffered from several limitations.

First, the study was supposed to pick three local TV stations to conduct a comparison with CTN in both content and frames. However, because of the language obstacle (TVB in Hong Kong was broadcast in Cantonese), only TTV in Taiwan and CCTV in mainland China were picked as the comparison samples. This lack of a Hong Kong comparison has deprived the study of an interesting and important dimension.

Second, although the news emphasis of CTN was put on Taiwan, the CTN evening news program was broadcast both from Hong Kong and Taipei, and the headquarters of CTN was still in Hong Kong. Observations and interviews there would make the picture fuller.

Third, the former owner of CTN was the founder of the organization. An interview with him would have provided more insightful and detailed information.

Fourth, the eight frames designed for this study seemed to be unable to fully examine the different frames used by those news items in terms of the image of Greater China. The comparisons of the three evening news programs in the framing analysis were also too simplified.

Future Research

There is no other study available related to the development of satellite TV channels which aim at providing pan-Chinese perspectives in Greater China. This study can be viewed as an initial effort to explore the media development in the three places in Greater China, and it can also serve as a reference for other researchers who are interested in similar subjects in the future.

There are a lot of opportunities and possibilities for media to develop in Greater China. The huge size of the audience in mainland China, the increasing communication activities in Greater China, and the growing economic power of Chinese people create a huge demand for a pan-Chinese

medium. There will be many interesting and noteworthy issues in this field to be explored and examined, such as the influences China may have on Hong Kong's and Taiwan's media after Hong Kong's return to China; the development of organizations like CTN in the future; and the possibilities of developing media internationalism or media regionalism.

REFERENCES

- Boyd-Barrett, Oliver (1980). The international news agencies. Beverly Drive, CA: Sage.
- Chan, Joseph Man (1992). Satellite television and the infosphere: National responses and accessibility to STAR TV in Asia. Research Report; Conference Paper.
- Chan, Joseph Man (1994). Television development in Greater China: Structure, exports and market formation. Research Report; Conference Paper.
- Chan, Joseph Man (1994). Media internationalization in China: Processes and tensions. Journal of Communication, 44, summer.
- China becomes a TV giant. (1992, November 20). People's Daily (Overseas) p. 3.
- Chang, T.K., Wang, J., & Chen, C.H. (1994). News as social knowledge in China: The changing worldview of Chinese national media. Journal of Communication, 44 (3), 52-69.
- Cutbirth, Craig W. et al. (1983). The Ethics of Media Framing of Issues in the 1980 Presidential Campaign. Research Report; Conference Paper.
- Davis, Dennis K. & Baran, Stanley J. (1995). Mass communication theory. Belmont: Wadsworth.
- Elliott, Philip & Golding, Peter (1974). Mass communication and social change: The imagery of development and the development of imagery. In De Kadt, Emanuel Jehuda & Williams, Gavin (Eds.), Sociology and Development (pp. 229-254). London: Tavistock.
- Fenby, Jonathan (1986). The international news services. New York: Schocken Books.
- Fortner, Robert S, (1993). International communication. Belmont: Wadsworth.
- Frederick, Howard H. (1993). Global communication and international relations. Belmont: Wadsworth.

- Friedland, Lewin A. (1992). Covering the world: International television news services. Twentieth Century Fund.
- Gamson, William A. (1989). News as framing: Comments on Graber. American Behavioral Scientist, 33, 157-161.
- Giddens, Anthony (1990). Islam and secularism. In Altaf Guahar (Ed.), The challenge of Islam (pp. 105-115). London: Islamic Council of Europe.
- Graber, Doris A. (1989). Content and meaning: What's it all About? American Behavioral Scientist, 33, 144-152.
- Harding, Harry (1993). The concept of "Greater China": Themes, variations and reservations. China Quarterly, 136, December.
- He, Zhou (1996). Chinese Communist Party press in a tug of war: A political-economic analysis of the Shenzhen Special Zone Daily. A paper presented at the Conference on Chinese Communication in the Age of Modern Media, Minneapolis, Minnesota.
- Iyengar, Shanto (1991). Is Anyone Responsible? How Television Frames Political Issues. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- King, Alexander & Schneider, Bertran (1991). The first global revolution: A report by the council of the Club of Rome. New York: Pantheon.
- Mcquail, Denis (1994). Mass Communication Theory (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Mowlana, Hamid (1996). Global communication in transition: The end of diversity? Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Pan, Zhongdang & Kosicki, Gerald M. (1993). Framing analysis: An approach to news discourse. Political Communication, 10, 57-61.
- Polumbiaum, Judy (1994). Between propaganda and junk-food journalism: Exploratory terrains in mainland Chinese news coverage. A paper presented to the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication annual meeting, Atlanta, U.S.A.
- Robertson, Roland (1992). Globalization: Social theory and global culture. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

- Robinson, Gertrude J. (1981). News agencies and world news. University Press of Fribourg Switzerland.
- Sepstrup, Preben (1989). Research into international TV flows. European Journal of Communication, 4, 393-408.
- Schiller, Herbert I. (1971). Mass Communications and American Empire. Boston: Beacon Press.
- Stevenson, Robert L. (1994). Global communication in the twenty-first century. Chapel Hill: Longman.
- Tankard, James W., Jr., Hendrickson, Laura, Silberman, Jackie, Bliss, Kris, Ghanem, Salma. (1991). Media frames: Approaches to conceptualization and measurement. Paper presented to the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication convention, Boston, MA.
- Thompson, John B. (1995). The media and modernity: A social theory of the media. Stanford University Press.
- Tu, Wei-ming (1991). Cultural China: The periphery as the center. Dae dalus, 120 (2), 1-32.
- Wallis, Roger & Baran, Stanley (1990). The known world of broadcast news. New York: Routledge.
- Woolcock, Jean C. (1997). The demise of Manley's democratic socialist government. Unpublished master's thesis, San Jose State University.

Appendix A

CODING SHEET

Story Title: _____ Date: _____

Frames	Lead	Statistics/ Chart/Graph	Quote	Source	Statement	Conclusion
1. Legitimate Government/ System						
Ideological Moderatism						
2. Us						
Them						
3. Localism						
Pan-Chinese						
4. Audience Recognition						
Narrator						

Appendix B

Intercoder Reliability Test

Story #	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
Coder 1	1	2	1	2	2	2	2	1	1	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	2	1	1	2
Coder 2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	2
*rel. (%)	50	50								50				50	50	50				

1= Legitimate Government/System 2= Ideological Moderatism

Story #	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
Coder1	4	3	3	4	4	4	3	3	3	4	4	4	4	4	4	3	4	4	3	4
Coder2	4	3	4	4	4	4	3	3	3	4	4	4	3	4	4	3	4	4	3	4
rel. (%)			50										50							

3= Us 4= They

Story #	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
Coder1	5	5	5	6	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	6	5	5	5	5	5	5
Coder2	5	5	5	6	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	6	6	5	5	5	5	5
rel. (%)															50					

5= Localism 6= Pan-Chinese

Story #	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
Coder1	8	7	7	7	8	8	8	8	7	8	8	8	8	8	7	7	8	8	7	8
Coder2	8	7	7	8	8	8	8	7	7	8	8	8	8	8	8	7	8	8	7	8
rel. (%)				50				50							50					

7= Audience Recognition 8= Narrator

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{Percentage of Intercoder Reliability Coefficient} &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{\# \text{Articles}} \frac{\# \text{Agree}}{\# \text{Readers}}}{\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{\# \text{Articles}} \# \text{Agree}}{(\# \text{Readers})(\# \text{Articles})}} \\
 &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{\# \text{Articles}} \frac{\# \text{Agree}}{\# \text{Readers}}}{\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{\# \text{Articles}} \# \text{Agree}}{(\# \text{Readers})(\# \text{Articles})}}
 \end{aligned}$$

* The rel. is 100 (%) unless listed.